

**Under the guise of intersectionality.
Inclusive development strategies for disadvantaged regions:
A case study in Tataouine, Tunisia**

By Luisa Willmann

Master Thesis in Political Science: International Relations, Security and Global Order

E-Mail: mail@luisawillmann.de

Student Number: 2713785

In Cooperation with IPA Switxboard

Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, Department of Political Science

Supervisor: Prof. Dr Eric Cezne

Word Count: 16.450

Amsterdam, 24 June 2021

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	5
ABSTRACT	6
1. INTRODUCTION	7
2. LITERATURE REVIEW AND CASE SELECTION.....	9
2.1. Societal issues: The challenges of Tunisia and its disadvantaged regions	10
2.2. Academic insights: The call for inclusiveness in regional development and its implementation ..	11
2.3. The gap of literature and research puzzle.....	13
2.4. Case Selection: Research questions, research goal, and hypothesis	14
3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK DEPLOYING AN INTERSECTIONAL APPROACH	16
3.1. The role of intersectionality for fostering inclusive development	16
3.2. Key concepts: People-centredness and connectivity	18
3.2.1. People-centredness	18
3.2.2. Connectivity	19
4. METHODS: DOING ETHNOGRAPHY IN TUNISIA.....	20
4.1. Substantiation of the intended ethnographic approach.....	20
4.2. Operationalization of the research	21
4.2.1. Research material and data collection	21
4.2.2. Tools and strategies to analyse the data.....	22
4.3. Handling of the Ethics.....	24
4.4. Limitations and challenges of ethnography	25
5. ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION.....	27
5.1. Opportunities	29
5.1.1. People-centredness and agency	30
5.1.2. Connectivity	32
5.1.3. Opportunities to foster inclusivity	36
5.2. Challenges	36
5.2.1. People-centredness and agency	37
5.2.2. Connectivity	42
5.2.3. Communication	45

5.2.4. Challenges to foster inclusivity	47
6. CONCLUSION	48
7. REFERENCES	51
8. APPENDIX	62
8.1. Consent Form	62
8.2. Internship Hosting Agreement.....	64

List of figures

Figure 1: Map of Tunisia with Tataouine Governorate highlighted	8
Figure 2: Amazigh village of Douiret in Summer 2021 with traditional Mosque	26
Figure 3: Map of Tunisia with the village of Douiret and the city of La Marsa	28
Figure 4: Basic Product Concept of IPA Workshop Series	29
Figure 5: The ancient Olive Mill that should be renovated in September 2021	33
Figure 6: Douiret with “ksar” (Arabic: <i>qaṣar</i>) on top where people used to store things	37

Acknowledgements

My special thanks go to my supervisor Mr Eric Cezne, who accompanied me with great advice and understanding in the specification of the topic, building a theoretical framework as well as during the fieldwork in Tunisia and the writing process.

I would like to thank IPA and Kilian Kleinschmidt for allowing me to gain insight into the work of their organization. Furthermore, I thank Imen El Amouri for the translation of the Arabic language and cultural context. Many thanks also to my friends and family for their support during this master in times of COVID-19.

Abstract

Strengthening inclusiveness has been identified as a priority in development work, especially in Tunisia that faces a weak socio-economic situation, an identity quest, and a lack of acknowledgement of diversity. These circumstances lead to marginalization, radicalisation, and migration in disadvantaged regions such as the governorate of Tataouine. However, recent development approaches were not inclusive in Tunisia. According to the literature and based on the context of Tunisia, intersectionality promises a frame to understand and foster inclusive development. This thesis aims to examine how inclusive development emerges on the ground through the lens of intersectionality, focusing on the cooperation of enterprises, people, and their skills. This thesis draws on data from a field trip to Tunisia, carried out between May and June 2021. The case study examines the opportunities and challenges of the inclusive development strategy applied by the organization IPA Switxboard in Tunisia's Southern Governorate Tataouine. The concepts of "connectivity" and "people-centredness" are discussed as drivers of development. I argue that it is important for academia and international organizations to acknowledge the challenges of applying inclusiveness in development work. They should engage with the heterogeneity of persons and their intersected aspects like ethnicity, gender, and identity to include different perspectives of a society and reach a higher level of inclusiveness. In doing so, it is necessary to consider these aspects not only as potential disadvantages but also as opportunities for inclusive development.

1. Introduction

More than 700 million people – ten per cent of the world population live in poverty, fighting to fulfil basic needs such as health and education (United Nations, n.d.-a). According to the United Nations (UN), the COVID-19 crisis might reverse decades of progress. This also concerns Tunisia, especially its disadvantaged regions (National Office of Statistics of Tunisia, 2020, p. 6).

In recent years, there has been more pressure to tackle problems with regards to poverty, globally, beyond aid and charity (UNDP, 2012). Recent studies claim the increasing relevance of development and the realization of open societies via inclusive innovations (Ab Aziz & Julai Poh, 2021, p. 1). Fostering regional development and inclusiveness are debated topics in academia, policies, and organizations (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, pp. 41–99; Paunov, 2013, p. 3; Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). Therefore, social innovation is used to foster development in disadvantaged regions and intend to include marginalized groups. The European Commission presented social innovation as a novel rural development tool (Bock, 2016, pp. 553–554). This also affects Africa as 56,6 per cent of the continent's population live in rural settings (Ile, 2020, p. 499). Buzzwords like “social innovation” are common in the development discourse (Cornwall, 2007). Tiina Kontinen and Anja Onali (2017, pp. 1–2) claim that many Nongovernmental organizations in international development are increasingly similar to each other, only some represent alternatives to it. According to the scholars, this homogenization is a result of institutional isomorphism which means that organizations tend to adopt similar directions to obtain legitimacy in an organizational field. This concerns their language, ideas, and frameworks and is a result of their increased cooperation (Fejerskov, Lundsgaarde, & Cold-Ravbkilde, 2016, p. 6).

Although development is a key priority, policy interventions could not foster economic development in resource-limited settings (George, McGahan, & Prabhu, 2012, p. 662). Most development interventions are in practice not on eye-level, not people-focused, and remain neo-colonial (Haverkamp, 2021; Watson, 2013) – they are not sustainable. Boaventura de Sousa Santos (2016, p. 9) states that after five centuries of teaching the Global North lost the capacity to learn from the knowledge and experiences of the world and concludes: “colonialism has disabled the Global North from learning in non-colonial terms” (p. 9). For instance, this means that the Global North does not take the developing countries' demands into account. This critique also concerns Tunisia: International actors as the European Union failed to strengthen inclusiveness in Tunisia which lead to grievances among

the population including poverty, unemployment, inequalities that have been the causes of risky migration journeys and religious extremism (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, pp. 41–99).

This thesis brings a critical, bottom-up perspective to inclusive development approaches and looks at the role of heterogeneous actors. I aim to understand how inclusive development emerges on the ground. The article draws on data from a field trip to Tunisia, carried out between May and June 2021. The fieldwork in Tunisia was conducted primarily in the country's southern interior region Tataouine.



Figure 1: Map of Tunisia with Tataouine Governorate highlighted

Source: Wikipedia (User:TUBS, n.d.)

The Governorate of Tataouine is marked with high unemployment rates, risks of extremism, and illegal migration. In this disadvantaged region, the organization Innovation and Planning Agency (IPA) Switxboard¹, which is a Tunisian Consulting Agency, aims to foster inclusive development through connectivity. This entails linking different people and organizations to enable the exchange of knowledge, resources, and technology. My research question is: What are the opportunities and challenges of the inclusive development approach deployed by the organization IPA Switxboard? In the following, I refer to IPA Switxboard as IPA. The head of the organization, Kilian Kleinschmidt, plays a central role in this thesis because he is shaping the development approach of IPA in Tataouine.

¹ Switxboard means putting cables together, physical cables – people to people relations (Talk, Kleinschmidt, La Marsa, 2021).

Similarly to Hafez Ghanem (2016, p. 3) argues, this thesis is not about violent extremism, politics or democratic transitions. It is about people, their connectivity, and development. However, still building on Ghanem, I claim that inclusive growth would have an impact on stability, peace, and an ending of violence in the Arab World. I refer to Tataouine as a disadvantaged region in the sense of limited economic and social opportunities and representation in the public. Not in the sense of culture and history which are rich in Tataouine.

This thesis proceeds as follows. First, I provide a literature review and justify the case selection. In doing so, I introduce the societal issues and main academic insights that lead to the gap of literature, research puzzle, and problem statement. Second, I present the theoretical framework. Thereby, the role of intersectionality is discussed and the concepts of “connectivity” and “people-centredness” as drivers of development. Third, I elaborate on my chosen method of ethnography by substantiating my methodological choice, indicating the operationalisation of the research, the handling of ethical aspects, and the study’s limitations and challenges. Fourth, I analyse and interpret the inclusive development approach applied by IPA, focussing on its opportunities and challenges, seen through an intersectional lens. Finally, the main findings and arguments are summarized in the conclusion.

I argue that it is important for academia and international organizations to acknowledge the challenges of applying inclusiveness in development work. They should engage with the heterogeneity of persons and their intersected aspects like ethnicity, gender, and identity to include different perspectives of a society and reach a higher level of inclusiveness. In doing so, it is necessary to consider these aspects not only as potential disadvantages but also as opportunities for inclusive development.

2. Literature Review and Case Selection

The literature review and case selection are divided into three parts. First, I introduce the topic by discussing societal issues and main academic insights. Second, the gap of literature and research puzzle are presented. Finally, I justify my case selection.

2.1. Societal issues: The challenges of Tunisia and its disadvantaged regions

Tunisia has since 2011 successfully made the political and institutional democratic transition process that has been marked by the elections for the Constitutional Assembly, the vote for a new Constitution, parliamentary and presidential elections, and the Carthage Agreement leading to the national government led by Youssef Chahed (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, p. 35). While after the Arab Spring, a wave of protests emerged in North Africa and the Middle East, the Tunisian National Dialogue Quartet succeeded in creating a peaceful dialogue. The Quartet was awarded the Nobel Peace Prize for its contribution to the "building of a pluralistic democracy in Tunisia in the wake of the Jasmine Revolution of 2011" (The Nobel Prize, 2015). Tunisia, as the only Arab Spring Country to have taken a democratic path, holds much promise (Watanabe, 2018, p. 1).

However, a dire socio-economic situation overshadows the achieved progress (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, p. 35). According to the National Office of Statistics of Tunisia (2020, p. 6), in Tunisia's interior South-Eastern regions including the governorates of Gabes, Medenine, and Tataouine the poverty is high with an average rate of 17.8 per cent. These governorates are heterogeneous and unequal, with richer people in urban areas and poorer in rural areas (National Office of Statistics of Tunisia, 2020, p. 10). Of these, Tataouine governorate is one of Tunisia's most marginalized regions with an unemployment rate of around 30 per cent, one of the highest in the country (Amnesty International, 2020). According to the human rights organization, in 2017 and 2020 protesters, especially young men, were calling for employment opportunities in the southern city Tataouine, which is the capital of Tataouine Governorate.

The weak socio-economic situation in Tunisia creates new challenges and security concerns (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, p. 35). Tunisia is a country of migrant origin and transit, but it has also become a country of destination in the last few years (Veron, 2020, p. 2). The majority of those trying to leave Tunisia irregularly are Tunisians looking for economic opportunities (Parker, 2020). Furthermore, Tunisia faces jihadist radicalization (Watanabe, 2018, p. 1). Lisa Watanabe (2018, p. 1) states that the country had major terrorist incidents in 2015 and attacks near the border with Libya in 2016. According to the scholar, many studies exist about violent extremism. However, those referred to as "extremists" constitute a heterogeneous group (Guessoumi et al., 2016; Watanabe, 2018). Therefore, there exist no single solution to it. Especially Tataouine with its high unemployment rate, few

opportunities, and geographical closeness to Libya is a centre for Jihadists (Gehlen, 2016, para. 2).

Fostering development is important to prevent terrorism and migration. Therefore, also Human Rights have to be strengthened (Ghanem, 2016, p. 136; United Nations, 2008). However, according to Silvia Quattrini (2018, pp. 2–4), the Tunisian government has defined its national identity as Arab and Muslim. In doing so, the author argues, they marginalized religious minorities and indigenous groups. This includes the country's black population which was for a long time invisible in the public life of the country but has long been confronted with racial discrimination. An official discourse on diversity is lacking (Quattrini, 2018, pp. 2–4). This identity problem and racial discrimination also play a role in Tataouine. A place that belongs to a former trade slaving route (Scaglioni, 2019, p. 115) and where among other groups, black Tunisians and the ethnic group barber, that call themselves "Amazigh", live (Arfaoui, 2017, para. 11). Ruth Hanau Santini (2018) describes Tataouine as an area with limited statehood (p. 7) and as characterized by a high informal economy (p. 66). Although Tunisia has achieved a lot since the revolution, much needs to be done to realize equality (Quattrini, 2018, pp. 2–4). Therefore, inclusivity could be used to counter inequality (see chapter 3.1. on inclusiveness).

To conclude, Tunisia faces a weak socio-economic situation, an identity problem, and a lack of acknowledgement of diversity. These circumstances lead to marginalization, radicalisation, and migration, especially in disadvantaged regions like Tataouine.

2.2. Academic insights: The call for inclusiveness in regional development and its implementation

In the following, I first elaborate on why conventional development approaches failed and on the academic call for inclusive development to foster equal growth which I also support. Second, I analyse the implementation of inclusive development in Tunisia.

Strengthening inclusiveness has been identified as a priority in development work (Cohen-Hadria et al., 2018, pp. 41–99; Paunov, 2013, p. 3; Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). Inclusive development refers to the engagement with communities and individuals, and therefore with all actors that play a role in development processes (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). The UN declared in their 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development seventeen goals. Among them are eradicate poverty, gender equality, decent work, economic growth,

innovation, reduced inequalities, sustainable cities, communities, and partnerships (United Nations, n.d.-b). The concept of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is probably the most accepted global framework to reflect on inclusive development (Dörffel & Schuhmann, 2020, p. 1). According to the Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network (2018, p. 1), countries have to undertake major long-term transformations of land use, urban development, and other dimensions to achieve these goals with the involvement of stakeholders (Bertelsmann Stiftung & SDSN, 2020, Chapter Executive Summary). Although the SDGs called for more partnerships and cooperation to foster development, only some countries have applied such a stakeholder engagement aimed at developing strategies to integrate different interest groups at the regional, provincial or municipal level (Bertelsmann Stiftung and SDSN, p. 50, 2020).

According to Ghanem (2016), inclusive growth is linked to the type of business, to different groups, the transfer of knowledge - and therefore tailored programs. To achieve inclusive growth, first, the system needs to support small businesses instead of large established enterprises (Ghanem, 2016, p. 88). The aim should be to link small and medium businesses to domestic and international markets. Second, the international community should include marginalised groups such as women, small farmers, and youth in the Arabic countries (Ghanem, 2016, pp. 103–106). Third, international aid should be combined with knowledge and technology transfer to achieve inclusion and social justice (Ghanem, 2016, p. 137).

Tanja Bastia (2014) claims that mainstream development studies are linked to economic development (see also Bardhan, 1990; Cypher, 2014; Hermes & Lensink, 2003; Hoskisson, Eden, Ming Lau, & Wright, 2000). Bastia calls for critical development studies that acknowledge gender, race, or class-based inequalities and multiple exclusions. Considering these different aspects and their relation to each other is called “Intersectionality” (Bastia, 2014, pp. 237–240). This notion of intersectionality informs my conceptual framework, which I account for in greater detail later (see chapter 3).

In this thesis, I define the aid system broadly like Terje Tvedt (2006) as a transfer of resources, skills, and technologies to assist recipients to address a wide range of issues. This aid system affects the implementation of development strategies in Tunisia. According to Lisa Watanabe (2018, p. 3), the socio-economic marginalization in Tunisia needs to be addressed by a regional development strategy that focuses on the development of the interior and border regions of the West and South.

Ghanem (88) and Sadiki (2019) claim that economic growth in the Arab countries has not been inclusive. Millions of people are still in the lower middle class (Ghanem, 2016, p. 88) and regional development in Tunisia has not redistributed resources as investments and administrative capacity to citizens of the regions equally (Sadiki, 2019, pp. 1–2). It was a top-down enterprise managed by the state since Tunisia attained independence and not about economic agency and ownership of Tunisia's centre and interior regions (Sadiki, 2019, pp. 1–8). Existing development strategies give little attention to the specific needs of the disadvantaged regions. According to Intissar Kherigi (2020, p. 9), decades of failed development policies contributed to a concentration of wealth in personal and regional networks which leads to decentralization and a search for new development solutions based on cooperation and support in the Arab World's peripheries. Building on Ghanem's arguments, Larbi Sadiki (2019, p. 8) observes that Tunisia has a record in development aid; however, tailored development strategies are needed. The aim should be to assist to build self-regenerating development.

To conclude, fostering inclusive development in Tunisia is necessary and aimed by international and local actors. However, due to the above-mentioned problems, I claim that the development approaches were not inclusive in Tunisia. According to recent literature and the context of Tunisia, intersectionality promises a frame to foster inclusive development as I will expand on later (see chapter 3).

2.3. The gap of literature and research puzzle

Building on the above, I can identify shortcomings in the development literature. First, despite an increased interest in inclusive development and with it the theoretical acknowledgement of diversity, a preoccupation with the different living conditions of people does not always translate on the ground: development interventions are based on a homogenizing perspective of development (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021, Chapter 1). According to Andrea Rigon and Vanesa Castán Broto, researchers and organizations follow assumptions that ignore the different needs of a diverse community and even contribute to hide those differences. However, the community, the collective identity, and the intra-group diversity need to be identified to foster development.

Second, shortcomings in the literature point to the need of understanding inclusive innovation processes in small, medium, and micro enterprises cooperating with local

entrepreneurs (Ab Aziz & Julai Poh, 2021, p. 1). While most researchers focus either on firms or skills as a key role for regional development, Charlotta Mellander and Richard Florida (2014, p. 327), ask future research to identify ways through which people and their skills and firms can cooperate to structure regional development.

The third shortcoming of literature refers to the African context. Researching the application of intersectionality in development in Africa, the literature remains scant. Most work focuses on intersectionality and gender studies (Moodley & Graham, 2015), diversity and education (Reygan & Steyn, 2017), or migration (Bastia, 2014). Only a few scholars such as Katie Tavenner and Todd Crane (2019, p. 316) apply intersectionality for development research in Africa. The authors claim that women and youth are common homogenized categories in development discourse and programmatic targeting in Africa. Therefore, they applied intersectionality in agricultural research for development to show the heterogeneity of different social groups in Tanzania.

To conclude, this thesis addresses these shortcomings by looking at how inclusiveness translates in an African country through the lens of intersectionality focusing on the cooperation of enterprises, people, and their skills. The above-mentioned discrepancy between intent and practice (also see chapter 2.2.) presents my research puzzle. Inclusiveness as a tool for regional development creates problems and opportunities for actors of development. Although inclusiveness has emerged as a dominant idea of governance of crises like managing and preventing radicalization and illegal migration, and therefore fostering development, little is known of how the idea of inclusiveness translates into practice. Hardly any ethnographic research exists that tests inclusive answers to development in the light of intersectionality, especially in the African context. In the following, I present my case selection to tackle this research gap.

2.4. Case Selection: Research questions, research goal, and hypothesis

To address the above-mentioned research puzzle and gap, I want to analyse a case that seeks to provide a development strategy focusing on connectivity and people-centredness and therefore on inclusiveness. For such alternative answers that foster regional development, I use the term inclusive innovation that is defined as “the development and implementation of new ideas which aspire to create opportunities that enhance social and economic wellbeing for disenfranchised members of society” (George et al., 2012, p. 663).

I look at the organization IPA that aims to identify resources like knowledge, capital, technology, skills and match them with the needs of disadvantaged people ('IPA Switxboard', n.d.). In doing so IPA contributes to the issues of illegal migration and radicalization.² In this thesis, I refer to this matching as "connectivity." I see IPA as an actor of the aid system because the agency works in the development and humanitarian sector (definition of the aid system see chapter 2.2.2 on academic insights). I analyse IPA's projects in the disadvantaged region Tataouine. Therefore, I follow an ethnographic approach. My research question is: What are the opportunities and challenges of the inclusive development approach deployed by the organization IPA? To answer my research question, I look at IPA's method *Regional Development Accelerator*, which I explain in the analysis in chapter 5.

My main research goal is to analyse the opportunities and challenges of an alternative answer to fostering regional development focusing on connectivity and people-centredness. I want to know how inclusiveness translates on the ground, meaning what are the different actors and how the organization needs to be built up to be open to them. I want to find out how identity, race, gender, and ethnicity influence regional development, meaning for example how tensions between different groups are being managed and tolerance strengthened. I hypothesize that applying an intersectional approach in development work is necessary to create a system that is open to everybody and uses all available opportunities. This means building different groups, finding hidden groups while considering the groups' heterogeneity. In other words: discovering the different types of actors (collective level), persons (individual level), and their relation is required to manage conflicts, to acknowledge tolerance, and diversity as well as to get an understanding of their specific needs, and to achieve sustainable development.

In the light of the above and my interest in accounting for things in combination, an intersectional perspective, as I argue next, is desirable because intersectionality allows me to see precisely the dynamics of different layers in the field. Further below, I elaborate more on it and provide the theoretical framework for my analysis.

² Interview, Kleinschmidt, March 2021, Zoom.

3. Theoretical Framework deploying an intersectional approach

This chapter accounts for the role of theory in this thesis. First, recent ideas for fostering inclusive development and the role of intersectionality are presented. Second, two approaches that are linked to intersectionality and directly inform my study are introduced: people-centredness and connectivity.

3.1. The role of intersectionality for fostering inclusive development

In the following section, I propose the appropriateness of an intersectional approach for making sense of dynamics in inclusive development. Intersectionality is related to a post-Marxist cultural and identity turn in feminist theories (Azmitia & Mansfield, 2021; Bastia, 2014; Cho, Crenshaw, & McCall, 2013; Fraser, 2007; Hopkins, 2019; Kynsilehto, 2011). Kimberlé Crenshaw (1981, pp. 139–145) coined the term “intersectionality” in her paper “Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex.” Crenshaw showed that black women encountered a hybrid combined race and sex discrimination in United States corporate hiring. Recently intersectionality has been important to the study of inequality, identity, and power relations (Cho et al., 2013), and scholars expanded it by linking it with other critical frameworks as postcolonial/transnational feminism and development studies (Bastia, 2014; Cho et al., 2013; Healy, Bradley, & Forson, 2011; McShane, 2021; Metcalfe & Woodhams, 2012; Rodriguez, Holvino, Fletcher, & Nkomo, 2016). For instance, Marcus Watson claims that development and colonialism in the African context follow a division and hierarchy building on “us-who-help” and “them-who-receive-help.” This means development is characterized by neo-colonialism (Watson, 2013, p. 25). Therefore, intersectionality can act as a decolonial methodology revealing the constructedness within imperialist conceptions and show new solutions (McShane, 2021, p. 62).

Intersectionality is used as an analytical tool to grapple with social problems and to build inclusive communities (Hill Collins & Bilge, 2020, chap. 1). This is important in development work because individual and collective perspectives need to be balanced as tensions between collective identities and individual experiences exist (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). As shown in chapter 2, although gender, race, knowledge, and poverty are

common causes for marginalization, these different dimensions, meaning the heterogeneity of persons, is often not acknowledged in development work. According to Bastia (2014), they could be addressed through an intersectional approach, which could show interconnected forms of oppression. Like Bastia (2014), I want to analyse the concepts of gender and ethnicity as intersected categories, not essentialized categories.

In this thesis, I use the following definition, provided by Patricia Hill Collins and Sirma Bilge (2020, Chapter 1):

Intersectionality investigates how intersecting power relations influence social relations across diverse societies as well as individual experiences in everyday life. As an analytical tool intersectionality views categories of race, class, gender, sexuality, class nation, ability, ethnicity, and age – among others – as interrelated and mutually shaping one another. Intersectionality is a way of understanding and explaining complexity in the world, in people, and in human experiences (Paragraph 3).

My understanding of intersectionality reflects a post-structuralist comprehension of global processes, the commitment to an inductive format, and interpretivist understanding. Poststructuralism means that language is constitutive of what is brought into being (Hansen, 2016, p. 1). This means I do not regard social facts as given. Instead, I emphasize different possibilities of social developments by focusing more on context and heterogeneity than on generalizations and homogeneity. I therefore adopt an inductive format to discover categories using open questions (Vromen, 2010, p. 257). In doing so, I apply an interpretivist epistemology that “provides a bottom-up framework for analysing social complexity. It emphasizes fluidity and networking. The relationships of component parts are not stable and fixed” (Kivikuru, 2019, p. 51). I want to trace back how development and different conceptions of it emerge, what the clashes/risks are, where the agreements/opportunities are.

This thesis uses intersectionality as a conceptual framework for two reasons. First, because I frame regional development as a complex and hybrid topic that requires complex and hybrid answers. Second, because the situation in Tataouine with its diverse actors and challenges is complex as there are marginalized and possible hidden groups that need to be included to foster development. Intersectionality is flexible to enable the analysis of aspects as identity, ethnicity, race, and gender. Like Bastia (2014, p. 244), I understand those aspects not only as constituting the disadvantaged but also as shaping positions of privilege. This means, I also want to apply the concept of intersectionality to study privilege. Like Yvonne Riaño (2011) who focuses on participatory research on skilled women migrants. Same as

Riaño, I claim that both disadvantage and advantage are necessary to reveal how aspects as gender and class intersect. This is important because my study addresses a region including more or less advantaged, that is, privileged persons. The study of privilege is not usually part of studies of intersectionality (Kynsilehto, 2011, p. 1547) and therefore increases the relevance of this research. In the following section, I present two concepts that inform this study and are connected to intersectionality.

3.2. Key concepts: People-centredness and connectivity

The alternative development strategy of IPA focuses on connectivity and people.³ My understanding of these two ideas is multi-layered: I use an open definition of connectivity to describe the relation between people and resources. Meaning the connectivity of different people that may belong to different groups, organizations, with other people and resources. This includes in a broader perspective also the connectivity between the aid system and different organizations. Intersectionality is suitable to see these connections because it enables me to explain how things are multilayered and how problems and opportunities express themselves in combination (see section 3.1. above). First, I focus on people as a driver of development. Second, the role of connectivity for development is presented. Finally, remarks about the aid system are made.

3.2.1. People-centredness

According to Kilian Kleinschmidt, the head of the organization IPA Switxboard that I am looking at in Tunisia, people are the driver of development.⁴ This perspective is in transitioning places like Tunisia (İşleyen, 2015) named “local ownership” which puts local people in the centre to analyse their situation and recognize their capacity to make a change (Chinkin & Kaldor, 2017; von Billerbeck, 2016). I use the term “people-centredness” to avoid the word “local.” Because, according to Thania Paffenholz (2015), this so-called “local turn” is hampered by a binary understanding of the local and international, romanticizes the cooperation of locals and internationals, and ignores actors as the local elite. The author requires a more nuanced understanding of the involved actors.

³ Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

⁴ Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

The African Union emphasizes “the need for people centred development” (African Union, n.d.-a). Africa should be an inclusive continent meaning all the citizens of Africa are actively involved in decision making, no child, men or women should be excluded, based on religion, ethnicity, or other factors (African Union, n.d.-b). In connection with the people-centred approach is a focus on the skills of people which emerged in the last decade caused by the change of an economy from an industrial economy to one based on knowledge, innovation, and skill (Mellander & Florida, 2014, pp. 318–327). However, economic opportunities contribute to maximizing growth rates that can lead to social tensions due to unequal growth (Pike, Rodríguez-Pose, & Tomaney, 2006, p. 234). This is also the case in Tunisia, on which I elaborate more in chapter 5 Analysis.

People-centred development supports the vision, skills, and ideas of people. However, it is connected to tensions because some people profit more than others. Therefore, intersectionality is suitable to understand who is advantaged, who not, what the tensions are, and how they can be handled. To apply people-centred development, people have to be connected, which I will elaborate on next.

3.2.2. Connectivity

In the following, I discuss the role of connectivity in development. As the North-South boundaries are blurring, Rory Horner (2020, p. 415) requires global development as a new paradigm because the world is getting more connected. In this thesis, I focus on regional development, which I see in connection with global development as the societal issues in disadvantaged regions require global action and solutions (see Chapter 2 Literature Review and Case Selection). However, although, we are living in a globalized world, not everybody is connected. Olaniyi Evans (2018, p. 568) argues for the connectivity of the poor via the internet and mobile phones to foster inclusion in Africa.

Maximilian Benner (2019, pp. 332–334) analyses cluster policy in Tunisia and points out that successful networking might contribute to knowledge and wisdom transfer in Tunisia. Zhanna Mingaleva et al. (2017, p. 140) address networking as a basis for cooperation leading to sustainable regional development. Networks are a way people organize themselves and a pattern of social relations whereas some are more connected than others (Slaughter, 2017, pp. 42–43). Taylor Saybolt (2009, p. 1027) claims that the aid network fails to help people because of poor coordination among organizations (Puerari et al., 2018, p. 1). As the

aid system can be seen as a driver for connectivity, the question arises to which extent this system offers room for innovation. According to George et al. (2012, p. 678), small entrepreneurial firms with ambitious social entrepreneurs are motivated to implement ideas for inclusive innovations, however, they often lack resources; whereas bigger ones have resources but lack motivation. More is elaborated on the question if the aid system leaves room for innovation in chapter 5.

To conclude, intersectionality is a relevant framework for development studies because of its complexity, hybridity, and acknowledging intersected categories of discrimination or privilege. I apply intersectionality with an ethnographic method which allows me precisely to look at many dimensions in combination on the ground and analyse the dynamics of IPA's working concepts of people-centredness and connectivity in regional development. Below I will elaborate on the methodology.

4. Methods: Doing ethnography in Tunisia

In the following, I start by substantiating my chosen method of this research: ethnography. Second, the operationalization of the research is being presented. Third, the handling of ethics is discussed. Finally, I consider the limitations and challenges of my chosen method. In this chapter, I use Amanda Coffey's book "Doing Ethnography" (2018) as a key reference because her "critical methodological engagement with ethnographic and qualitative research" (Coffey, n.d.) provides productive ways to unpack social worlds and everyday life as I discuss below.

4.1. Substantiation of the intended ethnographic approach

Ethnography is a suitable method to find out how inclusive development translates in practice because it allows several qualitative data collection techniques for gathering information about the daily life of a setting. Therefore, ethnography enables the study of social worlds in their natural state inductively using detailed observation (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 1). Ethnography creates ideas and analyses from the "bottom up." It is about multi-

layered understandings of settings and actors (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 5). These characteristics of ethnography allow the application of an intersectional lens for this research and suit my proposed theoretical framework as it also worked for Riaño (2011), Tavenner and Crane (2019), and Crenshaw (1981). These scholars have worked with an intersectional approach as well in ethnography, mainly conducting interviews that attest to the desirability of using ethnography through an intersectional lens.

For this research, I take the role of a “participant as observer”, meaning I navigate a role between participant and observer while maintaining the researcher status and becoming part of the field. Ethnography allows this approach according to Gold (1958 as cited in Coffey, 2018a, Chapter 5). I choose this role because fieldwork is about relations (Brett, 2021) – meaning connectivity which is a central aspect of this thesis. The role as a participant enables me to dive into IPA’s work. As an observer, I can explore the nature of the social setting while maintaining a limited impact on it.

4.2. Operationalization of the research

In the following, I first explain which kind of material I looked at and why. Second, the tools and strategies used to analyse the collected material are presented.

4.2.1. Research material and data collection

I employ four main sources to collect material: documents, observation, participation, and interviews. As recommended by Coffey (2018, Chapter 2), I engaged early with the field of study. In the pre-fieldwork, I did two interviews with Kilian Kleinschmidt via Zoom. Before starting the ethnographic fieldwork, I examined academic literature in development studies as well as reports of development organizations, especially concerning the African context and Tunisia in order to position my research and get an in-depth understanding of the context. My fieldwork takes place in an institutional setting and a cultural space, namely the organization IPA and their development project in Tataouine. My participant observation lasts five weeks, from the beginning of May till Mid-June 2021 and enables a close recording of what is naturally happening. This is important as concepts such as gender, race, and class, which are the key to intersectional understandings, may have different meanings in other

parts of the world (Rodriguez et al., 2016, p. 21). Therefore, I want to find out how these norms and definitions are locally constructed.

In ethnographic interviewing with employees, partners, and local target groups of the IPA programs I follow a semi-structured format, in which the topics are less tightly organized. As Kathryn Roulston and Myungweon Choi (2018, p. 234), I mean by semi-structured that the same topics represent the basics for questioning, however, the participant leads the sequencing of the questions (Roulston & Choi, 2018, pp. 234–237). The explorative nature of semi-structured interviews aligns with the intersectional approach of this thesis. In the semi-structured interviews, I ask questions about people's everyday experiences. Focus groups with multiple actors are held to discover dynamics between them. As a basis, I first ask open questions as proposed by Coffey (2018, Chapter 2) to understand what categories are used to make sense of events such as: What do you consider important? Second, I focus on how inclusive development emerges as an understanding. I ask, for instance: What does development mean to you? What are the challenges? What are the opportunities? What is your idea, wish, or vision? These questions are in line with the people-centred development approach (see chapter 3.2.1.). In interviews, conversations, and observations, I also focus on sounds, gestures, and body language as typical for ethnomethodology (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 1). I generate pictures of the research setting for analysis and visual memory for a documentary style of writing.

Overall, my ethnographic research project allowed me to engage with multiple, cross-sensorial streams of information. In the following chapter, I indicate how the research is operationalized.

4.2.2. Tools and strategies to analyse the data

First, the data organization is introduced. Second, the handling of the data analysis is presented. Finally, I make remarks about writing an ethnography.

Outside the field, I mainly work with my computer; In the field, I also work with a notebook and mobile phone. I use my computer to store the collected data and Google Cloud to make backup copies. Interviews, talks, and observations are analysed using the software ATLAS.TI. As recommended by Coffey (2018, Chapter 6), I organize the data chronologically as well as broadly by theme, category, and setting.

I understand data analysis like Coffey (2018, Chapter 2) as part of the research design that is undertaken, before, during, and after data collection. Initial document analysis helped me to foreshadow problems. In fieldwork, I follow the principle “analysis as you go.” For the data analysis, I identify themes and patterns following the process “code-and-retrieve.” This means developing a strategy for categorizing and coding the data based on potentially meaningful ideas and concepts. The complex data set is segmented into smaller units. As there do not exist hard rules for the coding frameworks (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 6), I developed a coding process that fits my framework and proceeds in four steps.

1. As Anselm Strauss (Strauss, 1987, pp. 32–56) recommends, I start with “open coding”- an unrestricted coding of the data to discover new categories that allow a nuanced reading of data.
2. I continue with “selective coding” meaning to look systematically for core categories (Strauss, 1987, p. 33). I group my data around the two analytical categories of my research question - opportunities and challenges of the development approach of IPA in general and with a focus on inclusiveness.
3. I use coding categories and frames from foreshadowed research questions and problems like categories as identity, race, ethnicity, gender, and themes as racism, discrimination, tolerance, diversity, focusing on connectivity and people-centredness.
4. Finally, I group the data along with the assigned codes of steps 1-3 and develop links across the data to create concepts and explore hierarchies. I look for patterns, irregularities, and exceptions. As Coffey (2018, Chapter 6), I understand coding prior interpretation as a way of simplifying data; and as an analytical procedure to transform and rethink data.

After the analysis, the ethnography is written which is a key aspect in ethnographic research. Postcolonial feminist critics of ethnographic writing question authority and authorship and issues of power and domination. Some saw reflexivity as an approach for interpretation (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 6). I aim to be reflective and transparent in the writing process and include contextual information. As ethnographic research deals with the social worlds of people, it is important to reflect on the handling of Ethics which I do in the following chapter.

4.3. Handling of the Ethics

I have conducted an ethics review self-check provided by the FSW Research Ethics Review Committee (2021) at my institution the Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. As a standard practice in qualitative studies, I promise confidentiality. This means the identities of research participants are not revealed. However, I am aware of critical issues concerning this approach addressed by Benjamin Baez (2002).

Participants are asked for informed consent which is typical for handling ethical concerns in order not to harm them. Consent is gained from the participant after informing her/him about the research, the right to privacy meaning the protection of identity, and the protection of physical, emotional, or other kinds of harm (Fontana & Frey, 19943, p. 372). I mention in the consent form that I contextualize the discussion by reference to overarching categories such as occupation and nationality. In doing so, I follow the so-called “Chatham House rule” meaning I use any of the information received, but do not reveal identities (Chatham House, n.d.). I pseudonymize my key informants, meaning that I assign a fictitious name to a source. I decided not to mention a specific date and place of encounter to secure their identity. Interviews with the organization leader Kilian Kleinschmidt are an exception: Given that this thesis is in collaboration with the organization IPA, led by Kilian Kleinschmidt, I choose to mention his name. There are advantages in a written agreement, however, it can be also undertaking verbally (Brenner, 2006, p. 326; Corti, Day, & Backhouse, 2000, p. 3). I ask for written consent for longer interviews to inform the participants and protect them as they give insides to their personal life and context which could make them identifiable and vulnerable. I use oral consent for shorter talks and observations which mainly concern the general setting.

In the Internship Hosting Agreement, I agreed to conduct my work within ethical and research standards and to respect confidentiality and non-disclosure of information and data received from IPA as per the terms specified. The Internship Hosting Agreement and the Consent Form are available in the Appendix.

I read intensively about the Tunisian context, refreshed my French skills, attended an ethnographic seminar – I tried to be best prepared for this research. However, I agree with Roddy Brett who states in an online seminar: “The presumption is if we follow all these recommendations, fieldwork is going to be perfect”, then Brett raises his arms apart: “It never is. Fieldwork is always improvisation” (Brett, 2021, sec. 22:00-23:00). This means that, apart from my preparation I also exert my judgment.

4.4. Limitations and challenges of ethnography

The most important tool in and of ethnography is the researcher. Ethnographers should reflect on how they fit in or have an influence on the setting (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 5). I grew up in a European country, have certain opinions and ways to understand the world, and I am a white female in the conservative region of Tataouine, which led to challenges.

As recommended by Coffey (2018, Chapter 5), I aim not to be too different from the setting and respect cultural norms. In meetings, I only gave men the hand for greeting if they offered it. I wore long trousers and shirts that go over the shoulder. I did not enter “Men’s Cafés”⁵, because this is unusual and would create attention. Such dilemmas of closeness and distance refer to negotiations of identity and positionality; intersected categories like gender and culture play a role (Bliesemann & Bøås, 2020, p. 12). Those aspects also influence my data gathering and analysis. It was easy to get access and contacts within the field because few white females are researching in this region. However, I do not know to which extent the data gathering was shaped by my gender, nationality, and culture. Sometimes language was an obstacle because I do not speak Arabic and my French has limitations. I thank Salma, a Master’s student who is originally from Tunisia, for the translation of the Arabic language and the cultural context.

As recommended by Berit Bliesemann de Guevara and Morten Bøås (2020, pp. 5–6), I conducted a security analysis.⁶ Salma and I were living alone remotely in the caves in the mountains of Douiret (see figure 2). Therefore, every night one man stayed at our place, either the owner of the caves or a local policeman. Further challenges were animals. We encountered a scorpion in the shower. Therefore, we checked shoes and beds for scorpions. I was bitten by bed bugs in the damp cave. Salma and I estimated around 200 bites.

⁵ In the IPA team, we called it “Men’s Café”. However, in Tunisia, people call the café *maqhana shaebiun* (Arabic) which means folk café in English.

⁶ According to Kilian Kleinschmidt, a security issue are the Islamic political parties *Ennahdha* and *Al-Karama* which drive on stagnation and want to undermine any success (Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine). During field research, I did not face security concerns in relation to these political parties.



Figure 2: Amazigh village of Douiret in Summer 2021 with traditional Mosque

Author: photograph

The main challenge was the closeness to the research field which is also mentioned by Coffey (2018). In La Marsa at the coast where IPA is headquartered, I lived in the office of the organization; in Tataouine I lived in a cave provided by the organization. In both cases, it was difficult to find privacy and step back from the research. Life under the IPA umbrella led to uncontrollable situations. Once a man was entering our accommodation in Douiret, asked for the owner, then the Italian intern and me for coffee. He pretended to be a professor at a university that we have visited, but we have never seen him before. As recommended by Coffey (2018, Chapter 5), I tried to distance myself from the field for critical analysis. This was possible in the cave with a closed door, on walks in the mountains, and days in Djerba. However, living in the field I also experienced the mobility problem of the region, when Salma was gone with our shared car, it would be a several hours trip for me to a supermarket in Tataouine City which is 21 kilometers away. And I gain an understanding of why relations are important because there are few opportunities like events and the free time is spent talking to people. I saw Kilian Kleinschmidt as a person who is convinced of his ideas and

takes up much space. I tried to be objective as best I could. My independence and asking questions were limited because IPA did not want that expectations were raised in the field. I decided to mention IPA, its role, but not directly connect my questions to the organization which allowed me to ask more questions. Furthermore, I tried to fulfil my role as a scientific researcher and not follow too intense a storytelling approach of researching and writing as I am used to in my work as a journalist.

Being confronted with unsatisfied people, I reflected on my situation. Having a German passport, education, competencies, and financial means allow me to choose. In light of my theoretical lens (see chapter 3), I realized how these intersecting categories lead to a privileged position and to a relation shaped by unequal power dynamics as also involved in North-South collaborations (Morten Bøås as cited in Bliesemann & Bøås, 2020, p. 7). Therefore, I considered these power dynamics to conduct a conversation on eye-level with my interviewees. For instance, I asked interviewees if they also have questions for me. Ethnography embodies further limitations: There exists no causal theory in poststructuralism (Hansen, 2016, p. 2) and a lack of a tightly bounded research design (Coffey, 2018, Chapter 2).

To conclude, ethnography is a suitable method to answer my research question and find out how inclusiveness translates in practice because of the following reasons: Ethnography allows me precisely to look at many dimensions in combination on the ground, it involves several qualitative data collection techniques for gathering information of the daily life, and it follows an inductive bottom-up approach.

5. Analysis and Interpretation

This chapter discusses the opportunities and challenges of the development approach applied by IPA. Each theme-related section accounts for my findings and interpretations of these. I round up the discussion by making sense of the gathered data looking at the many intersectionalities at stake. In doing so, I hint at how I am deploying my conceptual framework. My research question is: What are the opportunities and challenges of the inclusive development approach deployed by the organization IPA? The field research took

place in La Marsa in Northern Tunisia and Tataouine in Southern Tunisia with a focus on the Amazigh village of Douiret (see figure 3).⁷



Figure 3: Map of Tunisia with the village of Douiret and the city of La Marsa

Source: Adapted from Wikipedia (n.d.)

Kilian Kleinschmidt is the main person overseeing IPA's development projects in the region of Tataouine. Therefore, it is important to look at him and what he does, to which my analysis adds a critical interpretation; particularly concerning his inclusive development approach in Tataouine which Kilian Kleinschmidt describes as follows:

We are going in stages to reach inclusiveness in all segments (...). You have to gain the trust of what you would define as leadership. There are different layers: tribal layer, governmental layer, societal and influential persons that matter (...). If you only work with women in the beginning, minorities, and so on - that will backfire (...). You need to ask yourself, and very few development programs allow the ones who are already strong to grow more. It will create jobs.⁸

In the following, I analyse the opportunities of the inclusive development approach by IPA.

⁷⁷ I only conducted one focus group and two interviews in another interior region of Tunisia that offers a similar situation as Tataouine.

⁸ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

5.1. Opportunities

First, I analyse and interpret the role of people-centredness. Second, I consider how IPA uses connectivity as a driver of development. Overall Tataouine has strategic importance offering natural resources like petrol and gas, a young population, a border to Libya, and comes with a touristic and artisanal potential.⁹ IPA follows in Tataouine the idea of the *Regional Development Accelerator* (see figure 4) which consists of labs and touristic tours that address different topics as agriculture, energy, art, or cuisine. The long-term aim is to produce repeating editions yearly (IPA Switxboard, 2020, p. 2). The basis of the *Regional Development Accelerator* is IPA's method *Opportunity Mapping*. The organization is mapping Tunisia and Tataouine for social services, training centers, businesses and connect them with partners in Tunisia and worldwide.



Figure 4: Basic Product Concept of IPA Workshop Series

Source: IPA Switxboard (2020, p. 2)

IPA focuses on tourism and farming. IPA aims to build a farm with organic farming, permaculture design courses, a research centre, water management, and an ecolodge covering an area of 70 hectares.¹⁰ IPA wants to transform a huge hotel into a tourism and action point.

⁹ Interview with entrepreneur, May 2021, Gafsa.

¹⁰ Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

In May 2021, the above-mentioned projects are planned, no construction has been started and no investment has been secured.¹¹ In Tataouine there is no permanent IPA team and no IPA office. However, IPA is restoring Amazigh caves for its employees in Douiret. As IPA wants to change the region, it is important to ask to which extent their approach is people-centred. During the open-coding process, “agency” emerged as a category which I also discuss in the following.

5.1.1. People-centredness and agency

I encountered people-centredness and agency towards employees, partners, and locals. Zohra, a female employee that is from Tataouine and was responsible for Tataouine projects explains that she was one of the people Kilian met in Tataouine. According to Zohra, he assessed opportunities and struggles and met people who contributed ideas. Based on that assessment he figured out what he wants to do.¹²

IPA applies an open-door policy. The team during my stay in Tataouine consisted out of Kilian Kleinschmidt, Salma a master student who describes herself as half-German-half-Tunisian¹³, the intern Marianna from Italy, and me. Kilian Kleinschmidt allowed us to come to Tunisia and provided us with a car, accommodation, and contacts. He considered our preferences regarding the date, time, and reason for the stay. He gave us the possibility to engage with our research/work interests which aligns with a people-centred approach (see chapter 3.2.1. People-centredness).

IPA wants to support the ideas of people who want to do something.¹⁴ I talked to a young man called Said who wants to open a small organization in Tataouine. He describes his identity as Arabic. He says, for him, it would not be difficult as he has competencies, knows the conditions, and his parents are supporting him.¹⁵ Here the intersection of gender, ethnicity, and social class becomes visible. In this case the combination of aspects privileges (see Bastia, 2014, p. 244; chapter 3) a person, his agency, and possibility to participate in development activities. Due to Said’s agency, he would fit into the target group of IPA.

¹¹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, March 2021, Zoom and field research, May 2021, Tataouine.

¹² Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

¹³ Salma was born in Tunisia and moved with fifteen years to Germany. She regularly spends time in Tunisia.

¹⁴ Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

¹⁵ Interview with young man, who works in several organizations, June 2021, Tataouine.

Kilian Kleinschmidt mainly works with Mohamed and a few other locals to prevent tensions. He says that Mohamed would be the only one who goes behind the intermediate interest and has long-term aims.¹⁶ We visited with Mohamed the ground of the planned farm. Mohamed says: “We could also plant figs as they are drier and more intense here.”¹⁷ Kilian Kleinschmidt explains that he responds to Mohamed because he has ideas and takes initiative.¹⁸ In this partnership, Mohamed has no experience in agriculture and no financial resources, but local knowledge, contacts, and agency. IPA brings in experts from agriculture, technology, and looks for an investor. Mohamed and IPA complement each other and have the same vision of building a farm. Kilian Kleinschmidt also aims to work with successful cases.¹⁹ Once he shows Mohamed pictures of a wooden construction that offers a stable open space in which workshops take place in Portugal and states: “We could do this in Tataouine.”²⁰

Furthermore, in some of the meetings with (potential) partners, Kilian Kleinschmidt is exchanging ideas. For instance, the regional tourism commissioner introduces the idea of a water park, and Kilian Kleinschmidt the idea of electric buses for the cut-off regions in Tataouine.²¹ He also wants to use *Future Storytelling* and ask people for their vision.²² This approach is similar to the people-centred development approach presented by Isioma Uregu Ile (2020, pp. 495–496) who asks the people for their dreams. However, according to Said, a young professional from Tataouine, *Future Storytelling* is difficult in Tataouine as some see it contradicting their belief. Said explains: “People do not talk about the future because Muslims think that Allah knows their future.”²³

In a later stage, IPA aims to include those who have not been included in a societal context like women which is in line with inclusive growth (Ghanem, 2016, p. 88). Other organizations already support women. For instance, the female owner of the only Women Café that I encountered in Tataouine supports talented women in rural areas to make and sell *margoume* (Arabic) which are handmade carpets.²⁴ In doing so, she focuses on skills to create useful products which is in line with the people-centred approach presented by Mellander and Florida (2014, pp. 318–327; see chapter 2.1.). Furthermore, this empirical case shows an

¹⁶ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

¹⁷ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

¹⁸ Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

¹⁹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

²⁰ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

²¹ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

²² Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

²³ Interview with young man, who works in several organizations, June 2021, Tataouine.

²⁴ Talk with the owner of the women café, June 2021, Tataouine.

entrepreneurial process at the regional level to uncover local strengths and to promote the regional economy as described theoretically by Maximilian Benner (2019, pp. 332–334). The owner was coached by a program of the Tunisian government to open the café. She showed agency as she reached out to an Italian organization that is supporting her. She says: “It is your matter. You have to do research and contact them.”²⁵ Her café provides a safe space for women. This case shows the opportunities of supporting entrepreneurs (the owner) who can later engage more with disadvantaged groups (women in rural areas). This is interesting as the incorporation of local entrepreneurs is a shortcoming in the literature (Ab Aziz & Julai Poh, 2021, p. 1, see chapter 2.3.).

To conclude, IPA is partly applying the people-centredness and agency approach because the organization is talking to the locals and employees, considering their ideas, skills, and wishes (see definition people-centredness chapter 3.2.1). I showed how development opportunities are expressed in intersectional lines: Education, competencies, and social status can be a privilege that contributes to the agency of people who are later the focus of the people-centred approach in the case of IPA and may reach disadvantaged groups. The opportunities of IPAs people-centeredness approach mainly refer to supporting the ideas of entrepreneurs. The next question concerns how IPA can foster development through connectivity.

5.1.2. Connectivity

In the following, opportunities of IPA’s connectivity approach are presented. First, the role of exchange in a conservative society. Second, the impact of tailored programs and long-term transformations of land use. Third, the power of networking.

Marianna, the intern from Italy, is smoking. Kilian Kleinschmidt says that this is probably the first time people see a woman smoking in Tataouine on the street.²⁶ He thinks that you can counter conservatism with exchange and activity.²⁷ Therefore, IPA arranges workshops. Last October, the Technical University Dresden and ESAD,²⁸ a private university

²⁵ Talk with owner of the women café, June 2021, Tataouine.

²⁶ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

²⁷ Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

²⁸ ESAD stands for L’Ecole Supérieure d’Architecture d’Audiovisuel et de Design.

in Tunis designed a project house in an architecture workshop.²⁹ In September 2021, a workshop with local and international architects to restore an ancient Olive Mill is set to take place (see figure 5). These workshops are connected to the importance of knowledge and technology transfer, emphasized by Ghanem (2016, p. 137; see chapter 2.2. on academic insights) and Benner (2006, pp. 332–334; see chapter 3.2.2. on connectivity).



Figure 5: The ancient Olive Mill that should be renovated in September 2021

Author: photograph

Also, Said, who works for several organizations, supports the idea of starting the cultural exchange with students of Tunisia and international students to avoid a cultural clash. He states that it is important to consider the mentality and cultural aspects.³⁰

Kilian Kleinschmidt and his partner Mohamed want to build the farm, mainly producing tomatoes for the international market, using sustainable techniques instead of chemical ventilators.³¹ Their approach overlaps with points raised by the Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network (2018, p. 1), which require long-

²⁹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, March 2021, Zoom.

³⁰ Interview with young man, who works in several organizations, June 2021, Tataouine.

³¹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

term transformations of land use to reach the SDGs (see section 3.2.2. on connectivity). Furthermore, IPA aims to create points for attraction and tourism. This could be described as a “tailored program” (Sadiki, 2019, p. 8; see section 3.2.2. on connectivity).

To reach connectivity, IPA employs networking which is in line with the arguments of George et al. (2012, p. 666) who emphasize the role of networking in resource-limited contexts (see chapter 3.2.2. on connectivity). I accompanied Kilian Kleinschmidt in his five days stay in May in Tataouine meeting important players in the tourism and agriculture sector. Because an informant of IPA is connected to politics, spontaneously a meeting with the Project Manager for External Affairs has been arranged. The aim was to schedule a meeting with the Governor of Tataouine to get add-ons for the projects as a street and electricity and reduce pushbacks. As in every meeting, Kilian Kleinschmidt presents himself, IPA, and their plans for the region. He talks quickly without interruptions about being an entrepreneur, about his experiences in humanitarian and development aid, the EU, and his connection to Gerd Müller.³² He introduces the farm, the related studies, ideas, and the investor coming next week. He presents IPA Experience³³, his plans concerning coworking spaces, and their cooperation with the University of California. Later the governor promises his support in a meeting.³⁴ To convince people, different aspects of Kilian Kleinschmidt shape his presence like age, contacts, ethnicity, gender, ability, and nation that led to a certain power (see chapter 3 definition of intersectionality provided by Collins and Bilge). The pedagogic assistant Adnan, supports the approach to talk first to the decision-makers like the governor or external investors to set up big projects because they are the ones who finance them.³⁵

IPA also connects with public and private partners. In a so-called “Co-Creation” lab IPA employees and engineers discuss Hydroponic Farms that enable fast-growing vegetables like tomatoes and spinach for areas in which you cannot farm.³⁶ The online session “Coalitions for impact”³⁷ attempts to identify outlines of new public-private partnerships. According to the Dutch ambassador to Tunisia, employment needs to be created to encounter illegal migration and terrorism. He introduces a tomato-producing company for the European market. Further actors emphasize the role of networking and agriculture and technology for

³² Gerd Müller is the German Federal Minister of Economic Cooperation and Development, May 2021.

³³ IPA Experience is the tourism department of IPA.

³⁴ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

³⁵ Interview with a pedagogic assistant, June 2021, Tataouine.

³⁶ Field notes, May 2021, La Marsa.

³⁷ The Conference about Tunisia is organised by the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs in cooperation with Society Impact. It took place in May 2021.

rural areas. Kilian Kleinschmidt also uses this session to communicate his ideas and look for partners.³⁸ The session shows that agriculture is a relevant field in Tunisia in which IPA engages.

The aid system offers to some extent room for innovative approaches such as IPA's. For instance, the Dutch government which organized the above-described session "Coalitions for impact" supports the cooperation between business actors, NGOs, and political actors.

IPA's connectivity approach offers further opportunities. According to Lukas, a former IPA intern who was also responsible for Tataouine, IPA's ambition is sustainable in the sense of long-term and ongoing development because it is also on the ground and not limited to 1-2 years.³⁹ The farm could create jobs if it is implemented and therefore counter the raised societal issues in chapter 2. There are advantages in doing business in Tataouine as paying fewer taxes⁴⁰ and the inclusion of Tunisian partners sometimes goes along with substitutions of the Tunisian government. Once the relations between actors are established, they will stay, says Tariq, the director of a primary school.⁴¹

To conclude, IPA fosters development through connectivity (see chapter 3.2.2. on connectivity) meaning the engagement with and the matching of actors from academia, business, civil society, politics. IPA wants to create exchange in a conservative society with workshops, tailored programs and aims to create jobs through long-term transformations. The head of the organization uses a strong network approach: He engages with other powerful people to create in the first instance change for people who want something. In making this perspective, I used my intersectional lens (see chapter 3) that allowed me to see how all of these factors manifest in combination. The next section questions to which extent the organization is inclusive in the light of the definition of inclusiveness in chapter 2.2., which relates to the engagement with communities and individuals (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021).

³⁸ Interview with a pedagogic assistant, June 2021, Tataouine.

³⁹ Interview with former IPA intern, May 2021, Zoom.

⁴⁰ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁴¹ Talk with director of a primary school & IPA partner, May 2021, Tataouine.

5.1.3. Opportunities to foster inclusivity

IPA is in terms of regional integration inclusive, as it tries to integrate a disadvantaged interior region as Tataouine (see Watanabe, 2018, p. 3; chapter 2.2. on inclusiveness) which was hidden in the public and economic discourse. Furthermore, IPA acknowledges different perspectives. Zohra, the IPA employee from Tataouine, says that there is room for innovation and ideas; the IPA team is now more gender-balanced; in Tataouine they mix one Tunisian and one international student/employee.⁴²

IPA's approach shows inclusive aspects as it is linked to tailored programs with knowledge and wisdom transfer (see Ghanem, 2016, p. 137, chapter 2.2. on inclusiveness). For instance, Kilian Kleinschmidt works together with locals and does projects with Tunisian and international students. IPA aims to engage with a variety of stakeholders which is in line with the points raised by Bertelsmann Stiftung et al. (2018, p. 1, chapter 2.2. on inclusiveness) and wants to include marginalised groups. Kilian Kleinschmidt wants to include female artists in his vision of the hotel. IPA aims to create jobs, have a factory and commercial structure for the farm which would help farmers to get into the European market and have increased salary.⁴³ Furthermore, IPA's open-door policy is inclusive as it allows interns and students to come and work with them and report honestly about what is happening.

To conclude, the approach of IPA is partly inclusive which relates to regional aspects, different groups, and the heterogeneity of society. In the following, I discuss the challenges of the development approach applied by IPA.

5.2. Challenges

This chapter is divided into four sections. I start with considering people-centredness. Second, I analyse and interpret connectivity. Then, I discuss the role of communication which has been identified as a key challenge during the open coding process. Finally, I analyse and interpret the deficits of IPA's inclusive approach. I look at the term challenge in two senses: in the light of a difficult task and in questioning IPA's approach.

⁴² Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁴³ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

5.2.1. People-centredness and agency

In this section, I look at the deficits of how IPA applies people-centeredness and agency and I engage with the challenges to achieve such goals in regional development in Tunisia.

5.2.1.1. Deficits of IPA's approach concerning people-centredness and agency

Kilian Kleinschmidt has many ideas for the region such as restaurants, astronomic parks, festivals, 3-D Star Wars Cinema, accommodations in the oasis, and planting vegetables in the traditional Amazigh houses. I question whether IPA's approach goes in line with people-centredness because it does not deal with the people's specific needs, interests, and local structures on which I elaborate below (see also section 3.2.1. on people-centredness). Once we were up at the "ksar" (see figure 6) which is a traditional, rural storage castle of the Amazigh, consisted of many hidden rooms. This could become one main tourist attraction. To what extent would the people of Tataouine like tourism? Kilian Kleinschmidt's answer: "It is a romanticised western vision of keeping everything as it is (...).⁴⁴ However, if you give people agency, maybe they want to get rid of all the stones."⁴⁵



Figure 6: Douiret with "ksar" (Arabic: *qaṣar*) on top where people used to store things

Author: photograph

⁴⁴ Fieldnotes, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁴⁵ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

In a people-centred approach, it is important to balance individual and collective perspectives (Hill Collins & Bilge, 2020, see section 3.2.1. on people-centredness). As recommended by Coffey (2018), I first asked open questions, such as what people consider as important (see chapter 4 on methods). Several interviewees emphasized the importance of tradition instead of tourism and money. The Amazigh activist Yaro mentioned that they would prefer to have rain.⁴⁶ Samir, an English teacher in Tataouine, says: “The values of the people are more based on religion and tradition instead of money. You can see that no one is showing off here with big cars although some might have millions in their bank account.” The Amazigh activist Yaro says: “Tourism will not work because the people are closed.” We encountered the closed culture in the village of Chenini when a woman was hiding her face with her scarf when she saw us as strangers. According to the producer of a media platform, people in Douiret would be more open than in other villages who would not accept the European mentality.⁴⁷ According to Said, people in Tataouine city are more open to modernity than in the villages.⁴⁸

Interviewees emphasized the need to respect the people if you want to do projects in Tataouine. The Amazigh Activist, Yaro says that: “Everything is communal, you call this *twiza*. When someone builds a house, everyone helps. This means for a project to work: everyone has to take part.”⁴⁹ For Adnan, a pedagogic assistant, this applies not only to the ones offering accommodations but also to others providing couscous and arts. He calls this “solidarity tourism.”⁵⁰ Also, the IPA partners Tariq and Khaled argue: “Everybody needs to gain.”⁵¹ The Amazigh activist Yaro emphasizes the need to respect the culture of Amazigh and Arabs. Therefore, you would need to talk to the people, ask them what they want, understand their way of life, and their traditions.⁵² In doing so, I experienced a lot of hospitality. In this case, my intersectional lens enabled me to discover a common need of actors with different ethnicity, gender, and culture: the need to talk and to respect.

Kilian Kleinschmidt wants first to gain the trust of what you would call leadership. In contrast, his partner, Tariq, is emphasizing the need to talk to the people and to create confidence. He says that the farm is forcing things, arrived from above, therefore they do not have trust and it could also be that it will not last. He thinks it would be more durable if they

⁴⁶ Talk with Amazigh representative, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁴⁷ Focus Group, IPA partners, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁴⁸ Interview with young man, who works in several organizations, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁴⁹ Talk with Amazigh representative, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁵⁰ Interview with a pedagogic assistant, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁵¹ Focus Group, IPA partners, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁵² Talk with Amazigh representative, May 2021, Tataouine.

started from the root, and that they need to work with the village and the community before the project grows, if not they will lose them.⁵³ Such a community engagement would be typical for an inclusive approach (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). The IPA team does not show a common vision of the approach in Tataouine. This raises the question to which extent the local partners as Tariq and their view are included in the development of the region by IPA, which would be typical for a people-centred approach.

The meetings that I accompanied Kilian Kleinschmidt in Tataouine did not focus on local skills and interests as it would be expected within a people-centred development approach (see section 2.3.1.) and became instead a top-down approach. IPA's approach in Tataouine mainly focuses on one partner - Mohamed. The citizens of Tataouine were not actively involved in the decision-making process as the African Union and Tunisian actors require. In some meetings, Kilian Kleinschmidt exchanged ideas, however, most of the time, he did not ask for the ideas of the other persons or listened carefully to them.⁵⁴ As being part of the IPA team, I did not discover the people-centredness/agency approach from Kilian Kleinschmidt's side towards us – as researchers and interns - in Tunisia. In the evening, Salma, Marianna, Kilian Kleinschmidt, and I, are sitting on bamboo chairs and a stone bench and have dinner. Kilian Kleinschmidt talks about his missions such as in Mogadishu in Somalia, in Zaatari in Jordan, and in Pakistan for the UN. He had a coffee with a princess, met a tribal leader, and has a connection to Elon Musk. In the five days we spent in Tataouine from early morning to late evening he did not ask us, what we do, and what our skills and experiences are.

IPA's approach to people-centredness has many shortcomings because it does not focus on local structures, skills, and actively involves the citizens of Tataouine which would be typical for a people-centred approach (see chapter 3.2.1.).

5.2.1.2. The challenge of the agency of women and youth and intersected aspects

In the following, I engage with the agency of specific groups because IPA's people-centred approach focuses on actors that want to do something. However, it is difficult for some actors to participate in development. Therefore, including specific groups as women is a challenge in development work and it is problematic in the case of IPA because the

⁵³ Focus Group, IPA partners, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁵⁴ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

organization oversees people that have no, or cannot show their agency. One reason for the limited agency is according to Zohra, the IPA employee from Tataouine, that the people of Tataouine adapted to being passive. She says that they need to get rid of the victim narrative and try to change it instead of waiting for something.⁵⁵ This passiveness is linked to the history, limited opportunities, and visibility of the people of Tataouine (see chapter 2.1. on societal issues) and challenges the work in regional development.

To get a better understanding of the complexities in development work, I choose to focus on youth and women because I identified them as target groups, and I have special access to them due to my age and gender. One challenge to reach inclusive development is gender which is in the light of the concerns I raised in chapter 2. In Tataouine, women are mostly invisible in public life. Men sit on plastic chairs in the main road, talk, and drink tea. Mostly men sell in shops. Some female students are on the street and few women in the market. Most women cannot meet men freely due to cultural reasons which limit their agency in development. When I met an entrepreneur with the IPA employee Olfa, in an interior region, her parents did not know that we met a man. “It is because of the respect for culture and tradition”, Olfa explains. Otherwise, her parents would think they have a love affair. In La Marsa, she would be free and can meet men.⁵⁶ Zohra, the IPA employee from Tataouine, states that in a conservative community such as in Tataouine there are social pressures.⁵⁷ I do not see the aim to include local Tunisian women in IPA’s approach. In the meetings that the Italian intern and I accompanied Kilian Kleinschmidt, no other woman than we were present. In May 2021, Kilian Kleinschmidt and the intern Marianna are the only ones working actively for IPA in Tataouine. This means that the local women, meaning more than half of the population of Tataouine, are at this stage also invisible in IPA’s approach. This is a deficit because women should be supported because of their limited agency.

My intersectional lens (see chapter 3) allows me to observe how gender intersects with religion, culture, and social status and influences the possibilities of women to participate in development. Women experience interconnected forms of oppression. Through my interpretivist epistemology, I see that the relationship of the parts is fluid (see Kivikuru, 2019, p. 51; see also chapter 3) because the place impacts women’s agency as Olfa can meet men more freely in La Marsa than in the interior regions.

⁵⁵ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁵⁶ Interview with IPA employee, May 2021, in an interior region of Tunisia.

⁵⁷ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

Many scholars such as Ghanem (2016, pp. 103–106; see also 2.2. on academic insights) and interviewees as the pedagogic assistant Adnan emphasized the need to talk to the youth. Their inclusion in development has challenges due to limited opportunities and agency. Olfa, the young woman from an interior region explains: “The young people need someone to motivate and guide them to develop.” Olfa comes from a middle-class family. Her father has two butcher shops, she studied. I ask her brother in the mid-twenties where he sees himself in five years. Ahmed answers: “It is difficult to set a goal in Tunisia. I want to have a communication centre. I work in a Tunisian organization; my monthly salary is not enough to live on. You can't amass that much money to start a communication centre.” His sister Olfa adds: “If you want to open an organization, you have to do a lot of paperwork.”⁵⁸

Yaro, the Amazigh activists, states: “Here is a lack of self-determination. The youth cannot determine the future. It is determined by the father. The missing agency is trained.”⁵⁹ According to the English teacher Samir: “The older ones take the decisions. I am 29 years old, but I am not considered to be an adult.”⁶⁰ Many young people of Tataouine are dissatisfied. Two of my interviewees think about crossing the Mediterranean Sea, one already tried it, failed, and wants to try it again. We can describe being young as a disadvantaged aspect due to limited opportunities that influence their agency, their impact on development, and intersects with other aspects such as traditions, education, and social status. However, higher social status and education do not necessarily mean more participation in development. It is important and a challenge in development work due to the heterogeneity of the group to find out what the youth wants, what their skills are, and to motivate them. IPA engaged with students from Tunis for the Architecture workshop. However, IPA did not engage with heterogeneous youth groups from Tataouine which have for instance no education and are therefore disadvantaged.

To conclude, it is a challenge to employ people-centredness and agency in Tataouine because people developed a passiveness or cannot act due to limited opportunities and culture. It is important to include women and youth in development. Same as Katie Tavenner and Todd A Crane (2019, p. 316; see section 2.3. on the research gaps in the literature), I claim that women and youth are commonly homogenized groups. My research has shown that the heterogeneity of these groups should be considered and their intersection with other

⁵⁸ Focus group, May 2021, in an interior region of Tunisia.

⁵⁹ Talk with Amazigh representative, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁶⁰ Interview with an English teacher, June 2021, Tataouine.

aspects such as religion and social status that influence their possibility in participation in development (see chapter 3 on intersectionality). However, IPA did not engage with both groups and did not activate their agency in the sense of a people-centred approach (see definition people-centeredness chapter 3.2.1). Instead, IPA supports mainly entrepreneurs. The question arises which challenges exist in connecting different persons that belong to different groups, which I elaborate on in the following.

5.2.2. Connectivity

Matching of partners, tensions and power relations, the creation of trust, and the role of the aid system have been identified as key challenges. Kilian Kleinschmidt remembers: “One guy did not come to the IPA house because he was from the right political party Ennahda.” He explains that you could not match him with the people from the School of Engineering from California. Kilian Kleinschmidt states that they must find out who the people are. Somebody does not have the ideal solution, but the person has worked in an environment like Douiret, where you have to deal with dust and mice.⁶¹ Zohra, the IPA employee from Tataouine, is also considering family issues. She says: “I am lucky that I am from a neutral family that is a bit neutral.” And remembers that once they were looking in Tataouine for someone to take her position. And somebody was from a specific family, which is not neutral. Therefore, she did not select him.⁶² According to Zohra, a challenge is the understanding of the context, especially the tribal impact because there are many different layers like culture, family, and tribal belonging. Zohra, says that she considered that one tribe in Douiret fought over borderlines with people from another tribe. In other situations, she could not distinguish between personal and tribal patterns. For instance, somebody said that an IPA project would not work. After two months, they understood that he wanted to take the project to his village.⁶³

We can observe that political, national, family, gender, and personal preferences influence the matching of partners. My theoretical lens allows me to see that complex tribal aspects intersect with cultural, social, and identity layers that challenge the development approach in Tataouine because many of those aspects are not visible – they can be a privilege or disadvantage under the iceberg. Once having a match, it is a challenge to keep the

⁶¹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁶² Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁶³ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

connection. For example, the Technical University Dresden is no longer in touch with ESAD after the architecture workshop.⁶⁴ This means that the aspired knowledge and technology transfer as well as human exchange (see chapter 5.1.2. Connectivity) do not continue and set boundaries to the sustainability of the project. Further challenges are language skills and the interpretation of language and acts. Lukas remembers the interaction during the workshop: “Not every participant can speak French, and not everyone in Tunisia can speak French. Certainly, not everyone can speak Arabic. There are cultural habits that you can tap into. Therefore, a good moderator is necessary.”⁶⁵

Another challenge of connectivity is racism. Due to my participant observation, I could gain an understanding of the concept of race which is important for an intersectional analysis and has different meanings in the world (Rodriguez et al., 2016, p. 21; see section 4.2 on research operationalization). The intern Salma and the master student Marianna should move into a guesthouse provided by the organization in La Marsa. “The owner does not want Tunisians in her house”, says Salma, who is half-Tunisian. Salma says that racism is about micro-dynamics and local racism. In Tunisia, people would ask: Where are you from Tunisia? At the coast are fish, Romans, they are whiter - Sfax and Tunis are upper class. On the contrary, some call people from Tataouine “people from the desert.”⁶⁶ IPAs partner Mohamed says that he experienced racism in Tataouine, due to his black skin colour although his family lived for 500 years in Douiret.⁶⁷ These examples show interconnected forms of oppression (see Bastia 2015, chapter 3) due to ethnicity, skin colour, origin, that challenge the matching of people and the work in development.

The development work of IPA creates conflicts that are in line with the explanation of Pike, Rodríguez-Pose, & Tomaney (2006, p. 234) of social tensions due to unequal growth (see chapter 3.2.1.). Kilian Kleinschmidt remembers that in the beginning, they were more open and talked with many people in Tataouine, however, tensions and jealousy grew and they changed, therefore, their approach. Kilian Kleinschmidt says: “Now, some people are angry with me. Because I choose to work with one person (...). If I would work with five different people at this stage, I would be pushed into the role of a donor.”⁶⁸ A partner of IPA says that a part of the tensions is also the missing team spirit: If I work with somebody else,

⁶⁴Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁶⁵ Interview with former IPA intern, May 2021, Zoom.

⁶⁶ Talk with master’s student, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁶⁷ Interview with IPA Partner, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁶⁸ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

the one is winning, and I am losing.⁶⁹ Zohra explains that in Tataouine many projects have an impact only in a period (also see chapter 1 Introduction). They would think Kilian's is just another one. She sees a potential conflict because IPA is mainly working in the village of Douiret and people may ask if their choice is based on culture because Douiret is Amazigh.⁷⁰

Kilian Kleinschmidt's approach to increasing tolerance with the exchange can create conflicts.⁷¹ He aims to buy a hotel. With "walking on the edge", he means that the hotel has an alcohol licence which would be good from the business perspective, however, Mohamed did not want to be associated with the bar.⁷² Several interviewees expressed concerns related to such projects. For instance, the 29-year-old teacher Samir says that a pub in Tataouine would be nice. However, he explains that he could not go there as his parents should not know that he drinks. And that many people would abuse it as they are raised with tabus.⁷³

Certain power relations could be seen between IPA and its partners. Kilian Kleinschmidt, the white German entrepreneur, stays on the land for the future farm and says: "This is my land", and views over the dry area. Next to him stands the local owner of the land.⁷⁴ Here we can see how development challenges between the organization and local partners are expressed in intersectionality lines. Nationality plays with race, contacts, and personal ambitions. Although Kilian Kleinschmidt claims that they are equal partners, my observations indicate a power gap between them. In making this observation I used intersectionality as a decolonial methodology to deconstruct imperialist conceptions (McShane, 2021, p. 62; see chapter 3).

Trust was emphasized in several interviews to prevent tensions in regional development. A butcher who has been working for 40 years tells that many people do not pay immediately, because there is trust and people know each other.⁷⁵ This indicates a network with strong social relations as described by Slaughter (2017, pp. 42–43). The butcher says: Being patient and honest with the people would be the recipe for success.⁷⁶ There are several ways to establish trust. Tariq states that people must see that you are capable of what you are doing.⁷⁷ Zohra proposes to let people see the wins if they are cooperating.⁷⁸ According to

⁶⁹ Partner of IPA, May 2021, Zoom.

⁷⁰ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁷¹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, April 2021, Zoom.

⁷² Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁷³ Interview with an English teacher, June 2021, Tataouine.

⁷⁴ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁷⁵ Focus Group, May 2021, in an interior region of Tunisia.

⁷⁶ Focus Group, May 2021, in an interior region of Tunisia.

⁷⁷ Talk with director of a primary school & IPA partner, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁷⁸ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

Mourad, you should be direct and legal, as the people will realize it soon.⁷⁹ For establishing trust competencies, experiences, honesty, and time are important. However, Kilian Kleinschmidt's approach is: "You are planning 50 projects, and one works."⁸⁰ The complex societal structure and historical background in Tataouine question his approach. Furthermore, the traditional aid system poses challenges to the approach of IPA. Kilian Kleinschmidt states that he is under pressure to gain money as there is no money in the aid system for the incubation of new ideas. He says that it would be good to manage a donor with money, however with donor money, they would not be allowed to move right or left.⁸¹

To conclude, fostering development with connectivity is a challenge because factors such as religion or family background, adaptability, and language must be considered for matching partners. The connectivity should be kept, which is not always the case in IPA's work. Another challenge of connectivity is complex racism. The traditional aid system poses challenges to IPA's approach. My intersectional framework (see chapter 3) enabled me to interpret IPA's connectivity approach in Tataouine as one with many shortcomings as it privileges the ones who are already in an advantaged position and involves unequal power relations and does not acknowledge the need for trust.

5.2.3. Communication

In this section, I discuss the topic of communication which emerged as a key challenge when coding the material (e.g., see section 4.2. on research operationalization). Kilian Kleinschmidt stands in the office in La Marsa and wants Salma, Marianna, and I to communicate in Tataouine that IPA is a facilitator giving the people a platform to eventually reach out to resources. He says the narrative should be: "We are not your founders"; it is you who drives this. He states that it is a fine line doing *Opportunity Mapping* and not to raise high expectations as people come with wishes. He remembered: "The last time, I ignored everybody, I did my shopping, signed my papers." He says that they have forbidden the students from the Technical University Dresden to engage with anyone in Tataouine.⁸² According to Lukas, the former IPA intern, the only local in this project was Mohammed.

⁷⁹ Interview with entrepreneur, May 2021, Gafsa.

⁸⁰ Field notes, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁸¹ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁸² Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

Zohra, the IPA employee, has an additional layer of challenge, as she states that people have high expectations as she is from Tataouine. Zohra explains that a big percentage of people think that development is related to the petrol field.⁸³ According to Kilian Kleinschmidt, the people in Tataouine think that he only wants to make money. He says that he was accused of wanting oil and gas.⁸⁴ Kilian Kleinschmidt aims to overcome this perception through activity with workshops and labs which is challenging as the attention is then again increasing.⁸⁵ Zohra states: “There are these situations when people see that my boss is a foreigner and think that I work for this country as a secret agent.”⁸⁶

We can see how in IPA’s case expectations are intersected with nationality and resources. I acknowledge the handling of expectations and the concept of IPA as a challenge. However, during field research, I did not experience many situations when somebody was expecting something from IPA. Instead, I see due to the societal and theoretical background of this thesis and the insights of interviewees (see section 5.2.1. on people-centredness), the non-communication of IPA’s side as the main shortcoming. I claim that the exchange is limited if students that participated in the architecture workshop in Douiret were not allowed to talk to anyone in Tataouine.

My intersectional observations show several challenges for development work. Women are limited in their agency in development due to cultural, social, and religious reasons. The youth has limited opportunities and resources to engage in entrepreneurship. Identity aspects such as belonging to specific tribes and families must be considered. Religion and racism influence possibilities to participate in development. Development creates tensions and power relations play a role. Therefore, trust and exchange are important. The above-mentioned challenges are intersected (see chapter 3 on intersectionality). The next chapter analyses whether IPA considers the above-mentioned aspects and applies inclusive development.

⁸³ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁸⁴ Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, La Marsa.

⁸⁵ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁸⁶ Interview with IPA employee, who was responsible for Tataouine, May 2021, La Marsa.

5.2.4. Challenges to foster inclusivity

Looking at the definition of inclusivity in the literature (see section 2.2.), there are many shortcomings in IPA's inclusive development approach. Inclusiveness is defined by the engagement with the communities and individuals, and the different needs of a diverse community (Rigon & Castán Broto, 2021). Kilian Kleinschmidt wants to change the region; however, this chapter has shown that he did not make a sufficient assessment of the needs and interests of the people. He says in a participatory group session people will tell you what you want to hear and that reality you would get in a café through spending time with the people, being part of the daily life.⁸⁷ But the longest time Kilian Kleinschmidt stayed in Tataouine was around ten days for the workshop with the architect students.⁸⁸ However, a study conducted in 2014 in Tataouine emphasizes the need for integrated and participatory approaches (Nefzaoui, El Mourid, & Louhaichi, 2014). Although there exists an open-door policy at IPA, as described, Kleinschmidt hardly listens carefully to other voices (see chapter 2.2. on people-centredness). IPA aims to reach inclusiveness in the later stage in Tataouine meaning to include for instance later marginalized groups in the farm project which would be in line with inclusive innovation (George et al., 2012, p. 663; see chapter 2.4. on case selection). However, the development of the region in Tataouine is a long process with financing challenges that can last for a long time – even though IPA wants to include people in the later stage and create jobs, maybe people will never be included. Inclusive growth means supporting small businesses and including excluded groups like women, small farmers, and youth (Ghanem, 2016, p. 88). However, IPA supports entrepreneurs and focuses on visionary projects.

Lukas, the former intern, concludes that the connectivity idea is based on the actors' actions and that the whole approach of the project does not pay attention to the differences and the background but picks the ones that have the most economic and cultural potential.⁸⁹ Supporting the ones who are already active, the entrepreneurs, the "better-off groups", is not in line with the definition of inclusiveness which aims to redistribute resources to citizens of the regions equally (Sadiki, 2019, pp. 1–2). Therefore, the project could contribute to a concentration of wealth (Kherigi, 2020, p. 9; see chapter 2.2. on academic insights). Even though, if the farm or the hotel might be implemented and more inclusiveness is reached in

⁸⁷ Interview, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁸⁸ Talk, Kleinschmidt, May 2021, Tataouine.

⁸⁹ Interview with former IPA intern, May 2021, Zoom.

later stages, the focus on influential players in the early stages combined with the lack of a detailed needs assessment and people-centredness leads to a base of the project that does not include heterogeneous groups and perspectives of the society in Tataouine.

6. Conclusion

In the paragraphs below, I address the research question of this thesis: What are the opportunities and challenges of the inclusive development approach deployed by the organization IPA Switxboard?

The opportunities of the inclusive development approach deployed by IPA are the following. IPA aims to include the disadvantaged region Tataouine. In doing so, IPA talks to locals and employees, considering their ideas, skills, and wishes which is in line with people-centred development. Thereby IPA supports the ideas of entrepreneurs. The head of the organization uses a strong network approach and aims to foster development through connections with actors from academia, business, civil society, and politics. Such stakeholder engagement is supported by the Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network (p. 50, 2020). IPA wants to foster exchange in a conservative society through workshops. The organization aims to create jobs through long-term transformations such as their project of a 70-hectare farm. In a later stage, jobs could be created and marginalised groups integrated. The open-door policy allows young researchers to explore the field of development with a critical lens. IPA's tailored program, the aimed knowledge and wisdom transfer, and the work towards inclusion of marginalised groups are in line with the definition of inclusiveness I raised in section 2.2.

The challenges and deficits of the inclusive development approach deployed by IPA are the following. Although IPA wants to change a lot in the region, no sufficient assessment of the needs and interests of the people was done which is required for an inclusive approach according to Rigon and Castán Broto (2021, Chapter 1). Therefore, the question has arisen in field research to what extent people would like changes such as tourism and what their interests are. Culture and tradition emerged as important values and a call for more opportunities. The Amazigh activist Yaro says: "You cannot make everyone happy, but you need the consent of the people."⁹⁰ Therefore, others emphasized the need for trust and a participatory communal approach. IPA's approach has several shortcomings as it does not

⁹⁰ Talk with Amazigh representative, May 2021, Tataouine.

focus on local structures, skills, and does not actively involve the citizens of Tataouine as it would be typical for a people-centred approach. In this early-stage IPA focuses on the engagement with better-off groups like influential players and entrepreneurs. It is based on the actors' actions. This is especially in Tataouine a deficit because people are passive or cannot act due to limited opportunities and culture. Instead of supporting their agency, IPA does not engage with disadvantaged groups such as youth and women and the heterogeneity of the society. This research recommends IPA to talk to the diverse locals of Tataouine and include them in the process. As interviewees emphasized traditions and culture should be respected, which follow a communal nature. Furthermore, the agency of disadvantaged groups needs to be supported.

My research and analysis through my intersectional lens have shown that academia and international organizations need to acknowledge the challenges of applying inclusiveness in development work. They should engage with the heterogeneity of persons and their intersected aspects like ethnicity, gender, identity, race to include different perspectives of society and reach a higher level of inclusiveness. In doing so, it is necessary to consider those aspects not only as a potential disadvantage but also as a privilege. My research has partly confirmed my hypothesis. An intersectional approach in development work is necessary to create a system that is open to everybody. After this research, I add the aspect of a system that also supports the agency of a diverse society. This means as I hypothesized in this thesis' introduction, to building different groups, finding hidden groups while paying attention to heterogeneity. The different types of actors (collective level), persons (individual level), and their relations need to be discovered to manage conflicts, to acknowledge tolerance, and diversity as well as to get an understanding of their specific needs and aims – to achieve sustainable development.

This research focuses on a case study conducted in May and June 2021 in Tataouine. The aim was to find out how inclusiveness emerges on the ground talking to a variety of relevant actors. This broad picture is essential for the basis of this topic, however, it also led to limitations. For instance, I focussed on women and youth and did not engage in-depth with the families of the rural areas of Tataouine. Because it would require extended periods for trust-building to talk openly about their concerns. Therefore, I talked to two representatives of the villages, the Amazigh activist Yaro, and the Khaled who works for a media platform. This field research is also limited by a time frame of five weeks which does not allow in-depth analysis of social relations. Furthermore, I focused on English Literature.

Future research could look at other cases in which development focused on the powerful in the first stage and analyse to which extent it was possible to reach inclusiveness in later stages. In addition, future research should engage more with literature from the Arabic World. Furthermore, more research needs to be done on how to deal with intersected aspects of oppression and how to reach disadvantaged groups and support their agency.

7. References

- Ab Aziz, K., & Julai Poh, J. A. (2021). Driving Inclusiveness from the Grassroots: The Tambunan Inventors. *International Journal of Management, Finance and Accounting*, 2(1), 88–105. <https://doi.org/10.33093/ijomfa.2021.2.1.6>
- African Union. (n.d.-a). Agenda 2063: The Africa We Want. Retrieved 6 May 2021, from African Union website: <https://au.int/en/agenda2063/overview>
- African Union. (n.d.-b). Our Aspirations for the Africa We Want. Retrieved 6 May 2021, from African Union website: <https://au.int/en/agenda2063/aspirations>
- Amnesty International. (2020). *Tunisia: Authorities must investigate excessive use of force in Tataouine*. Amnesty International. Retrieved from Amnesty International website: <https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/MDE3027472020ENGLISH.pdf>
- Arfaoui, K. (2017, September 17). Living Together in Tunisia. Retrieved 18 April 2021, from Global Policy Journal website: <https://www.globalpolicyjournal.com/blog/17/09/2017/living-together-tunisia>
- Azmitia, M., & Mansfield, K. C. (2021). Editorial: Intersectionality and Identity Development: How Do We Conceptualize and Research Identity Intersectionalities in Youth Meaningfully? *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12, 625765. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.625765>
- Baez, B. (2002). Confidentiality in qualitative research: Reflections on secrets, power and agency. *Qualitative Research*, 2(1), 35–58.
- Bardhan, P. (1990). Symposium on the State and Economic Development. *Journal of Economic Perspective*, 4(3), 3–7.
- Bastia, T. (2014). Intersectionality, migration and development. *Progress in Development*, 14(3), 237–248.

- Benner, M. (2019). Cluster Policy in Tunisia. In *Science, technology, and innovation policies for inclusive growth in Africa – human skills development and country cases* (pp. 319–247). LIT Verlag. Retrieved from https://books.google.de/books?hl=de&lr=&id=YLjPDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA319&dq=Tunisia+regional+development&ots=IBtTMa1Ceq&sig=_IgxIkoFvuZKRWuuqWVvV9I1Qnw#v=onepage&q=Tunisia%20regional%20development&f=false
- Bertelsmann Stiftung and Sustainable Development Solutions Network. (2020). *Sustainable Development Report 2020. The Sustainable Development Goals and Covid-19*. Cambridge University Press. Retrieved from Cambridge University Press website: https://s3.amazonaws.com/sustainabledevelopment.report/2020/2020_sustainable_development_report.pdf
- Bertelsmann Stiftung, & Sustainable Development Solutions Network. (2018). *Global Responsibilities. Implementing the Goals* (pp. 1–463). Retrieved from https://s3.amazonaws.com/sustainabledevelopment.report/2018/2018_sdg_index_and_dashboards_report.pdf
- Bliesemann, B., & Bøås, M. (2020). Doing Fieldwork in Areas of International Intervention into Violent and Closed Contexts. In *Doing Fieldwork in Areas of International Intervention: A Guide to Research in Violent and Closed Contexts* (pp. 1–20). Bristol University Press: Bliesemann & M. Bøås.
- Bock, B. B. (2016). Rural Marginalisation and the Role of Social Innovation; A Turn Towards Nexogenous Development and Rural Reconnection. *European Society for Rural Sociology. Sociologia Ruralis*, 56.
- Brenner, M. E. (2006). Interviewing in educational research. In *Handbook of Complementary Methods in Education Research* (pp. 357–370). Santa Barbara: University of California, Green JL., Camilli G., Elmore P.B.

- Brett, R. (2021). *The politics and challenges of doing field research in insecure places*.
Online Webinar: Danish Institute for International Studies. Retrieved from
<https://www.diis.dk/en/event/the-politics-and-challenges-of-doing-field-research-in-insecure-places>
- Chatham House. (n.d.). Chatham House Rule. Retrieved 29 April 2021, from Chatham House website: <https://www.chathamhouse.org/about-us/chatham-house-rule>
- Chinkin, C., & Kaldor, M. (2017). *International Law and New Wars*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781316759868>
- Cho, S., Crenshaw, K. W., & McCall, L. (2013). Toward a Field of Intersectionality Studies: Theory, Applications, and Praxis. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 38(4), 785–810. <https://doi.org/10.1086/669608>
- Coffey, A. (2018). *Doing Ethnography*. 1 Oliver's Yard, 55 City Road London EC1Y 1SP: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Coffey, A. (n.d.). Amanda Coffey. Retrieved 1 May 2021, from SAGE Publishing. Author website: <https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/author/amanda-coffey>
- Cohen-Hadria, E., Abderrahim, T., Cherif, Y., Colombo, S., Ghanmi, E., Kausch, K., ... Zardo, F. (2018). *The EU-Tunisia Privileged Partnership—What Next?* Barcelona: European Institute of the Mediterranean.
- Cornwall, A. (2007). Buzzwords and Fuzzwords: Deconstructing Development Discourse. *Development in Practice*, 17(4/5), 471–484.
- Corti, L., Day, A., & Backhouse, G. (2000). Confidentiality and Informed Consent: Issues for Consideration in the Preservation of and Provision of Access to Qualitative Data Archives. *Qualitative Social Research*, 1.
- Crenshaw, M. (1981). The Causes of Terrorism. *Comparative Politics, Ph.D. Programs in Political Science, City University of New York*, 13(4), 379–399.

- Cypher, J. (2014). *The Process of Economic Development* (0 ed.). Routledge.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203080580>
- Dörffel, C., & Schuhmann, S. (2020). What is inclusive development? Introducing the multidimensional inclusiveness index. *Jena Economic Research Papers*, 2020–015.
- Evans, O. (2018). Connecting the poor: The internet, mobile phones and financial inclusion in Africa. *Digital Policy, Regulation and Governance*, 20(6), 568–581.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/DPRG-04-2018-0018>
- Fejerskov, A., Lundsgaarde, E., & Cold-Ravbkilde, S. (2016). *Uncovering the dynamics of interaction in development cooperation: A review of the ‘new actors in development’ research agenda*. Copenhagen: Danish Institute for International Studies.
- Fontana, A., & Frey, J. H. (1994). Interviewing. The Art of Science. In *The Handbook of Qualitative Research* (pp. 361–376). Thousand Oak: Sage Publications.
- Fraser, N. (2007). Feminist Politics in the Age of Recognition: A Two-Dimensional Approach to Gender Justice. *Studies in Social Justice*, 1(1), 23–35.
- FSW Research Ethics Review Committee. (2021, April 23). Ethical Review Self Check.
Retrieved from https://vuletteren.eu.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_6hCj2czIWzboW6V
- Gehlen, M. (2016, December 23). Die Wüste der Extremisten (German) / The desert of the extremists (English). *Zeit*. Retrieved from <https://www.zeit.de/politik/ausland/2016-12/tunesien-is-jihadismus-tataouine-anis-amri>
- George, G., McGahan, A. M., & Prabhu, J. (2012). Innovation for Inclusive Growth: Towards a Theoretical Framework and a Research Agenda: Innovation for Inclusive Growth. *Journal of Management Studies*, 49(4), 661–683.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-6486.2012.01048.x>

- Ghanem, H. (2016). *The Arab Spring Five Years Later: Toward Greater Inclusiveness*.
Brookings Institution Press. Retrieved from
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7864/j.ctt1657tv8>
- Guessoumi et al., M. (2016). Le terrorisme en Tunisie à travers les dossiers judiciaires.
Centre Tunisien de La Recherche et Des Études Sur Le Terrorisme, 1–146.
- Hanau Santini, R. (2018). *Limited Statehood in Post-Revolutionary Tunisia: Citizenship, Economy and Security*. Springer.
- Hansen, L. (2016). *Security as Practice: Discourse Analysis and the Bosnian War*. London: Routledge.
- Haverkamp, J. (2021). Collaborative survival and the politics of liveability: Towards adaptation otherwise. *World Development*, 137, 105152.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2020.105152>
- Healy, G., Bradley, H., & Forson, C. (2011). Intersectional Sensibilities in Analysing Inequality Regimes in Public Sector Organizations. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 18(5).
- Hermes, N., & Lensink, R. (2003). Foreign direct investment, financial development and economic growth. *Journal of Development Studies*, 40(1), 142–163.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00220380412331293707>
- Hill Collins, P., & Bilge, S. (2020). *Intersectionality*. Polity Press.
- Hopkins, P. (2019). Social geography I: Intersectionality. *Progress in Human Geography*, 43(5), 937–947. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0309132517743677>
- Horner, R. (2020). Towards a new paradigm of global development? Beyond the limits of international development. *Progress in Human Geography*, 44(3), 415–436.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0309132519836158>

- Hoskisson, R., Eden, L., Ming Lau, C., & Wright, M. (2000). Strategy in Emerging Economies. *The Academy of Management Journal*, 43(3), 249–267.
- Ile, I. U. (2020). Repositioning African Union Agenda 2063: An Exploration of the Nexus between People Centered Development and Indigenous Knowledge Systems (With Specific Reference to AU Aspiration 6). *African Journal of Governance and Development*, 9(2), 493–509.
- IPA Switxboard. (2020, November). *Regional Development Accelerator. Product Presentation*. Presented at the Douriet, Tataouine. Douriet, Tataouine.
- IPA Switxboard. (n.d.). Retrieved 11 April 2021, from IPA switxboard. Innovation and Planning Agency. Global Networking and Humanitarian Expertise website: <https://switxboard.org>
- İşleyen, B. (2015). The European Union and neoliberal governmentality: Twinning in Tunisia and Egypt. *European Journal of International Relations*, 21(3), 672–690. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066114554464>
- Kherigi, I. (2020). Decentralisation: The Search for New Development Solutions in the Arab World's Peripheries. *Arab Reform Initiative*, 9.
- Kivikuru, U. (2019). From community to assemblage? ICT provides a site for inclusion and exclusion in the global south. *The Journal of International Communication*, 25(1), 49–68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13216597.2018.1544163>
- Kleinschmidt, K. (2021, March 24). *Interview A-1 [Zoom]*.
- Kontinen, T., & Onali, A. (2017). Strengthening Institutional Isomorphism in Development NGOs? Program Mechanisms in an Organizational Intervention. *SAGE Open*, 7(1), 215824401668872. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016688725>

- Kynsilehto, A. (2011). Negotiating Intersectionality in Highly Educated Migrant Maghrebi Women's Life Stories. *Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space*, 43(7), 1547–1561. <https://doi.org/10.1068/a43367>
- McShane, J. (2021). What does it mean to 'decolonise' gender studies?: Theorising the decolonial capacities of gender performativity and intersectionality. *Journal of Women's Studies*, 22(2), 17.
- Mellander, C., & Florida, R. (2014). The Rise of Skills: Human Capital, the Creative Class, and Regional Development. In *Handbook of Regional Science* (pp. 317–330). Berlin Heidelberg: Springer.
- Metcalfe, B. D., & Woodhams, C. (2012). Introduction: New Directions in Gender, Diversity and Organization Theorizing - Re-imagining Feminist Post-colonialism, Transnationalism and Geographies of Power: Gender, Diversity and Organization Theorizing. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 14(2), 123–140. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2370.2012.00336.x>
- Mingaleva, Z., Sheresheva, M., Oborin, M., & Gvarliani, T. (2017). Networking of small cities to gain sustainability. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 5(1), 140–156. [https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2017.5.1\(12\)](https://doi.org/10.9770/jesi.2017.5.1(12))
- Moodley, J., & Graham, L. (2015). The importance of intersectionality in disability and gender studies. *Agenda*, 29(2), 24–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10130950.2015.1041802>
- National Office of Statistics of Tunisia. (2020). *Carte de la pauvreté en Tunisie*. National Office of Statistics of Tunisia in collaboration with the World Bank. Retrieved from National Office of Statistics of Tunisia in collaboration with the World Bank website: http://www.ins.tn/sites/default/files/publication/pdf/Carte%20de%20la%20pauvreté%20en%20Tunisie_final.pdf

- Nefzaoui, A., El Mourid, M., & Louhaichi, M. (2014). The Tribe: Platform of Participatory Local Development and Management of Communal Rangeland Resources. *Journal of Arid Land Studies*, 24(1), 57–60.
- Paffenholz, T. (2015). Unpacking the local turn in peacebuilding: A critical assessment towards an agenda for future research. *Third World Quarterly*, 36(5), 857–874.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2015.1029908>
- Paunov, C. (2013). Innovation and Inclusive Development. A Discussion of the Main Policy Issues. *Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development*, 63.
- Pike, A., Rodríguez-Pose, A., & Tomaney, J. (2006). *Local and regional development*. London : New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Puerari, E., de Koning, J., von Wirth, T., Karré, P., Mulder, I., & Loorbach, D. (2018). Co-Creation Dynamics in Urban Living Labs. *Sustainability*, 10(6), 1893.
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su10061893>
- Quattrini, S. (2018). *Identity and Citizenship in Tunisia: The Situation of Minorities after the 2011 Revolution* (pp. 1–32). Minority Rights Group International.
- Reygan, F., & Steyn, M. (2017). Diversity in Basic Education in South Africa: Intersectionality and Critical Diversity Literacy. *Africa Education Review*, 14(2), 68–81. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2017.1280374>
- Riaño, Y. (2011). Drawing New Boundaries of Participation: Experiences and Strategies of Economic Citizenship among Skilled Migrant Women in Switzerland. *Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space*, 43(7), 1530–1546.
<https://doi.org/10.1068/a4374>
- Rigon, A., & Castán Broto, V. (2021). *Inclusive Urban Development in the Global South: Intersectionality, Inequalities, and Community*. Routledge.

- Rodriguez, J. K., Holvino, E., Fletcher, J. K., & Nkomo, S. M. (2016). The Theory and Praxis of Intersectionality in Work and Organisations: Where Do We Go From Here?: Gender, Work and Organization. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 23(3), 201–222.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/gwao.12131>
- Roulston, K., & Choi, M. (2018). Qualitative Interviews. In *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Collection* (pp. 233–249). 1 Oliver’s Yard, 55 City Road, London EC1Y 1SP: SAGE Publications Ltd.
<https://doi.org/10.4135/9781526416070>
- Sadiki, L. (2019). Regional Development in Tunisia: The Consequences of Multiple Marginalization. *Brookings Institution*, 13.
- Santos, B. (2016). Epistemologies of the South and the future. *From the European South*, 1, 17–29.
- Scaglioni, M. (2019). *Becoming the ‘Abid Lives and Social Origins in Southern Tunisia* (Bayreuth University). Bayreuth University. Retrieved from
<https://boa.unimib.it/retrieve/handle/10281/283186/414983/Becoming%20the%20%27Abid.pdf>
- Seybolt, T. B. (2009). Harmonizing the Humanitarian Aid Network: Adaptive Change in a Complex System. *International Studies Quarterly*, 53(4), 1027–1050.
- Slaughter, A.-M. (2017). Networks Everywhere. In *The Chessboard and the Web: Strategies of Connection in a Networked World*. Yale University Press.
- Strauss, A. L. (1987). *Qualitative Analysis for Social Scientists*. Cambridge University Press.
- Tavener, K., & Crane, T. A. (2019). Beyond “women and youth”: Applying intersectionality in agricultural research for development. *Outlook on Agriculture*, 48(4), 316–325.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0030727019884334>

- The Nobel Prize. (2015). National Dialogue Quartet. Facts. Retrieved 6 May 2021, from The Nobel Prize website: <https://www.nobelprize.org/prizes/peace/2015/tndq/facts/>
- Tvedt, T. (2006). The international aid system and the non-governmental organisations: A new research agenda. *Journal of International Development*, 18(5), 677–690.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/jid.1304>
- UNDP. (2012). *Creating Value for All—Strategies for Doing Business with the Poor*. UNDP. Retrieved from UNDP website:
<https://www.rw.undp.org/content/rwanda/en/home/library/poverty/creating-value-for-all---strategies-for-doing-business-with-the-.html>
- United Nations. (2008). *Human Rights, Terrorism and Counter-terrorism*. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Retrieved from Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights website:
<https://ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/Factsheet32EN.pdf>
- United Nations. (n.d.-a). Goal 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere. Retrieved 11 April 2021, from Sustainable Development Goals website:
<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/poverty/>
- United Nations. (n.d.-b). Take Action for the Sustainable Development Goals. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>
- User:TUBS. (n.d.). *Map of Tunisia with Tataouine highlighted*. Wikipedia. Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tataouine_Governorate
- Veron, P. (2020). *Tunisia: Possibilities for reform and implementation of migrant reception and protection*. European Centre for Development Policy Management.
- von Billerbeck, S. B. K. (2016). *Whose Peace?: Local Ownership and United Nations Peacekeeping*. Oxford University Press.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198755708.001.0001>

Vromen, A. (2010). Debating Methods: Rediscovering Qualitative Approach. In 3. *Theory and Methods in Political Science* (pp. 249–266). Hampshire, England: Political Analysis Series.

Watanabe, L. (2018). Preventing Violent Extremism in Tunisia. *Policy Perspectives*, (6), 3.

Watson, M. D. (2013). The Colonial Gesture of Development: The Interpersonal as a Promising Site for Rethinking Aid to Africa. *Africa Today*, 59(3), 3–28.

Wikipedia. (n.d.). Douiret. Retrieved 11 June 2021, from
<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Douiret>

8. Appendix

8.1. Consent Form

CONSENT FORM

-----INTERVIEW/FOCUS GROUP PARTICIPATION-----

Project title: Inclusive development strategies for disadvantaged regions.

A case study in Tataouine, Tunisia

Thank you for listening to the information about the project. If you are happy to participate, please read and sign the form below to confirm that you agree to participate.

Consent statement

I agree to participate in the research project led by Luisa Willmann. The purpose of this document is to specify the terms of my participation in the project through being observed and interviewed.

1. I have been given sufficient information about this research project. The purpose of my participation as an interviewee in this project has been explained to me and is clear. I am aware that Luisa Willmann also makes observations to gain an understanding of the dynamics and aspects of inclusive development. I have been given the opportunity to ask questions about the project and my participation.
2. My participation in this project is voluntary. There is no explicit or implicit coercion whatsoever to participate.
3. Participation involves interviews, focus groups, or conversations. The interviews will last approximately 40-90 minutes. The focus groups are talks with multiple actors. The conversations involve talks in the daily life of the research setting. I allow the researcher(s) to take written notes during the interview, focus group, or conversation. I also may allow the recording (by audio tape) of the interview. It is clear to me that in case I do not want the interview to be taped at any point in time I am fully entitled to withdraw that permission and the tape will be stopped.
4. I understand I can withdraw at any time without giving reasons and that I will not be penalised for withdrawing nor will I be questioned on why I have withdrawn.

5. I have the right not to answer any of the questions. If I feel uncomfortable in any way during the interview session, I have the right to withdraw my participation.
6. I have been given the explicit guarantees that, if I wish so, the researcher will not identify me by name in any reports using information obtained from this interview, and that my confidentiality as a participant in this study will remain secure. In research publications, the researcher contextualizes the discussion by reference to overarching categories such as occupation, nationality, ethnicity, and gender. This means that the researcher may quote and make use of the information received but does not reveal identities. In all cases, subsequent uses of records and data will be subject to standard data use policies at the EU (Data Protection Policy).

Citation and quotation agreement:

I understand that my words may be referenced indirectly and quoted directly.

7. You have the right to request reviewing the transcript pertaining to your participation.
8. I have been provided with the contact details for the researcher(s).

Date:

Researcher's signature:

--	--

Date:

Participant's signature:

--	--

8.2. Internship Hosting Agreement⁹¹

Internship

Hosting Agreement

between

IPA Switxboard Suarl
10, Rue Bel Hassan Ben Chabane,
2700 La Marsa
Tunisia

Represented by Kilian Kleinschmidt, CEO
(the “company”)

And Ms. Luisa Willmann

(the “intern”)

IPA Switxboard agrees to host Ms Willmann for a period of 1 month between the 13 May and 13 June 2021 to conduct field research for her studies in International Relations at the **Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam** in its project site of Douiret/Tataouine. IPA agrees to host Ms Willmann free of charge, provide transportation and advice on demand.

IPA does not take responsibility for the content of Ms Willmann’s research while Ms Willmann will conduct her work within ethical and research standards and respect the sensitivity of the cultural environment and at no moment represent IPA unless requested. Ms Willmann agrees to respect confidentiality and non-disclosure of information and data received from IPA Switxboard as per terms specified below. She furthermore agrees not to use the information received from IPA in any other publication than in her official thesis paper duly referenced.

CONFIDENTIALITY AND NON-DISCLOSURE

1.1 Confidentiality. All information owned by the Company or any Group company or licensed by or to the Company or any Group company, or concerning the Company or any Group company, their customers and any services rendered by the Company or any Group company is hereinafter collectively referred to as “Confidential Information.” Confidential Information shall include any information relating to the Company or any Group company which may be obtained by the Intern in the course of performing its duties under the Agreement, which is or should be reasonably understood to be confidential or proprietary to the Company (or relevant Group company), including, the material terms of this Agreement, information about players on the Company or any Group company’s web sites, technical processes and formulae, source codes, product designs, sales, cost and other

⁹¹ The agreement is called „Internship Hosting Agreement”; however, I did not conduct an internship at IPA, I only researched within the organization.

unpublished financial information, product and related business plans, projections, and marketing data, or software. The provisions of this Clause shall not apply to Confidential Information that has, through no fault of the Consultant, become public knowledge. The Intern shall not make copies of Confidential Information except for the express purpose of carrying out the agreed research. The Intern shall (i) return to the Company any material or media supplied by the Company (or any Group company) to the intern and any copies made by or for the intern or at the request of the Company (or any Group company) immediately destroy any such material or media and if required by the Company certify that such destruction has taken place and (ii) provide the Company with any media containing Materials or Inventions created in accordance with this Agreement immediately on the Company's request or on termination of this Agreement.

1.2 Non-Disclosure. The Intern agrees that, except as directed by the Company or as permitted in this Clause, the intern will not at any time during or after the internship under this Agreement: (i) disclose any Confidential Information to any person, or permit any person to examine and/or make copies of any reports or any documents that come into the intern's possession or under the intern's control by reason of the internship except as may be directed by the Company; or (ii) use the Confidential Information other than for the purposes of writing the research paper, and that upon termination of this Agreement, the intern will return to the Company all documents, papers, and other matter in the intern's possession or under the intern's control that contain or relate to such Confidential Information.

Confidential Information may also be protected by legal privilege. The intern shall take all necessary steps to ensure that the protection of legal privilege in any Confidential Information is not lost or waived except as may be waived by the Company (or applicable Group company). If any person or authority requests any Confidential Information, whether informally or by summons or subpoena, such request must not be complied with, to the extent that such non-compliance is permitted by law, unless or until directed to do so by the Company or until mandated by final order of a court after the exhaustion of all available appeals.

The intern shall keep any Confidential Information that may be the subject of legal privilege in files separate from any other files that the intern might have, now or in the future, relating to the Company, and not share or disclose such information and documents with or to any third party other than representatives of the Company.

The obligations of confidentiality and non-disclosure in this agreement will not apply to any information which is available to the public other than because of any breach of this Agreement.


Kilian Tobias KLEINSCHMIDT
IPA SWITXBOARD Tunisie
Kilian Kleinschmidt
Mét: 1655465C/A/M/000
10, Rue Hassen Ben Chabeen La Marsa


Luisa Willmann